

Reconnaissance Level Historic Resources Survey

Village of Fayetteville

Town of Manlius, Onondaga County, New York

Funding provided by the following:

Certified Local Government Grant Program

The activity that is the subject of this survey report has been financed in part with Federal funds from the National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior.*

and

Preserve New York

Preserve New York is a signature grant program of the New York State Council on the Arts and the Preservation League of New York State.

Preserve New York is made possible with the support of Governor Andrew M. Cuomo and the New York State Legislature.

Prepared by Jessie A. Ravage
Preservation Consultant
34 Delaware Street
Cooperstown, New York 13326

30 September 2018

*This program receives Federal financial assistance for identification and protection of historic properties. Under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, and the Age Discrimination Act of 1975, as amended, the U.S. Department of the Interior prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, national origin, disability, or age in its federally assisted programs. If you believe you have been discriminated against in any program, activity, or facility as described above, or if you desire further information, please write to: Office of Equal Opportunity National Park Service, 1849 C Street N.W., Washington, D.C. 20240.

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	1
Methodology.....	3
Description of Existing Conditions.....	5
Physical and geopolitical setting.....	5
Spatial organization	5
Circulation systems and settlement patterns	6
Architecture	8
Historic period architecture (ca.1792–1948).....	9
Postwar architecture (ca.1948–70).....	13
Post-1970	15
Historical and Architectural Overview	17
Settlement Period (1792–ca.1830	17
Erie Canal Village (ca.1830–1849)	20
Hydraulic Village (1850–1898)	24
Early Syracuse Commuter Suburb (1898–1944)	32
Postwar Suburb (1945–1970).....	39
Post-1970	44
Assessment of Historic Integrity and Recommendations	45
Sources	49
Appendices	
1: Key map and list of properties reviewed	
2: Photographs of representation streetscapes in areas of Fayetteville developed before 1948	
3: Review of subdivisions	
4: Historic maps (1834, 1849, 1860, 1874, 1885, 1892, 1898, 1904, 1909, 1927, 1943, 1948)	

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

1

INTRODUCTION

This reconnaissance-level historic resources survey was undertaken by the Village of Fayetteville located in the town of Manlius, Onondaga County, New York. The Village of Fayetteville has a small National Register Historic District (Genesee Street-Limestone Plaza NRHD) encompassing 44 properties including mainly high-style houses and three churches facing onto East Genesee Street (NY 5) and commercial buildings on the north side of Limestone Plaza. The documentation focuses mainly on buildings as exemplars of architectural style with a brief discussion of the conditions leading to its historic development.

More recent field visits for small projects in Fayetteville suggested to State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) personnel that a far larger number of buildings within the village boundary now appear eligible for listing in the National Register, and that the district could be expanded to offer the advantages of listing to more village residents and also the municipality.

The village retained me to prepare a reconnaissance level survey of all property within the village boundary in July 2017. In this survey, I have endeavored to set the buildings in the original district and the nearly 1,800 properties beyond that narrowly defined core within the larger context of how Fayetteville developed and why it looks the way it does today. The structure of the village and forms, tastes, and configurations of its buildings represent periods of development over two hundred years of history that have been influenced by geology and the geography of transportation development and consequent economic change. The report does not focus on individuals except as they have a direct relationship to these aspects of village history. Many sources have presented information on President Grover Cleveland, who spent part of his boyhood in Fayetteville, and Matilda Joslyn Gage, a prominent proponent for women's suffrage, who lived on East Genesee Street, and I have chosen not to add to that information here.

Numerous mapping episodes support this study. Early mapping delineated divisions in the Military Tract of central New York, first in manuscript in the 1790s. David H. Burr published the first statewide atlas depicting surveys showing lotting throughout New York in 1829. A survey undertaken by the state in 1834 in advance of expanding the Erie Canal shows the route of the prism of the canal and features adjacent to it. The first printed map of Fayetteville was published in 1849. A map prepared a few years later showed the street plan, but it was not until 1860 that the first map was surveyed that showed individual main buildings and owner names. A second such effort was published in 1874. Oddly, in a period when lithographic bird's-eye views of villages and cities were popular, it appears no one ever prepared such a map of Fayetteville. The Sanborn Fire Insurance Company began mapping Fayetteville in 1885 and published updates and expansions of its survey in 1890, 1896, 1904, 1909, 1919, 1929, and 1943. This series provides a detailed picture of the village's growth and change nearly to the end of the historic period (50 years previous to the onset of the project per standard National Register of Historic Places review) in Fayetteville.

In implementing the work plan, I was greatly aided by a dedicated volunteer corps drawn from the village's historical commission and deputy clerk Karen Shepardson. Commission members undertook photographing individual properties and both they and Karen uploaded information to CRIS, the state's cultural resources inventory system. Karen has also dug out maps

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

2

in the village archives that have fleshed out the development of the village in the post-World War II period and been the main administrative contact. Craig Polhamus, head of the commission, and Pamela Bender have provided research materials I might otherwise not have found. In a similar vein, Barbara Rivette, the village (Fayetteville) and town (Manlius) historian, has offered information and reviewed the historical narrative that forms part of this report. I am grateful to everyone.

Jessie A. Ravage
30 September 2018

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

3

METHODOLOGY

Reconnaissance-level historic resources surveys are undertaken to identify cultural resources and assess the degree of their historic integrity. Such studies often discuss these resources in terms of themes of significance as outlined in the regulations for documentation for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. This allows interested parties to grasp the historic integrity¹ and significance of particular resources or groups of resources within a given area. A good study should allow those parties to take a more comprehensive approach in planning for these resources. Such planning might include listing in the National Register of Historic Places, local historic district designations, considerations for planning ordinances in areas with cultural resources, planning for economic development, or specific preservation projects. Sometimes such studies have their origins in a potential threat to the resources under review.

This study was undertaken to assess the Village of Fayetteville located in the town of Manlius in Onondaga County, New York. The Village of Fayetteville has a small National Register Historic District encompassing 44 properties including mainly high-style houses and three churches facing onto E Genesee Street (NY 5) and also a few brick commercial on Limestone Plaza that was listed more than 20 years ago. During field visits for small projects in Fayetteville, State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) personnel suggested that this small district might be expanded to be more broadly representative of the village's historical development.

Fayetteville encompasses approximately 1,800 properties with buildings. These include a sizable historic core (nearly 900 properties) dating to the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. This core is wrapped on nearly all sides by generally intact postwar residential subdivision development that more than doubles the number of parcels within the village boundary. These development areas are generally readily identifiable by period and type. Because it is desirable to carry out reconnaissance level surveys within identifiable boundaries, tiers of review were determined in consultation with the SHPO survey unit for this survey.

Properties in the historic core and also those facing the historic highways of Genesee Street (NY 5) east of Manlius Street (NY 257) and Salt Springs Road were reviewed and recorded individually in CRIS, the state's cultural resource inventory. Photographs of individual properties throughout these areas were shot by a volunteer corps composed of members of the village's historical commission. The preservation consultant prepared the text information to be recorded in CRIS in a spreadsheet compiled from tax parcel data. This spreadsheet includes approximate construction dates based on historic mapping and visual review, eligibility recommendations, and descriptions for these properties. The volunteers then cut and pasted the text from the spreadsheet into CRIS.

Properties within the post-war residential subdivisions were reviewed and photographed as neighborhoods by the consultant. This documentation is presented as a separate section of the report. Each development is described and briefly discussed in terms of how it fits into patterns of

¹ The National Register of Historic Places identifies seven aspects of historic integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

4

suburban residential development of the period. Representative photographs illustrate how each development currently looks. While none of these neighborhoods is currently eligible for listing in the National Register, they may well be found eligible in the future. This section of the report is designed to establish a baseline for such review. CRIS does not allow for a collective review of this sort, and so these properties are not individually located in CRIS, but the report section is uploaded as a pdf as part of the survey report.

The narrative section of the report is composed of two main sections—a description of the study area and a narrative describing the study area’s architectural and community development during the historic period. The description tells what can be seen if one visits the study area. It mainly avoids interpretation to allow the reader to see the resources without prejudice. This begins with the setting, describing the region’s topography, and then moves to its spatial organization, circulation patterns within or overlaid on the landscape, and its built environment. Reviewed in aggregate, these components can tell us much about how a place developed and illuminate the historic significance of its built environment within the larger context of place.

The historical narrative develops the context in which the built environment described in the first section developed. This section should help the reader grasp how the surviving resources represent and illustrate the Village of Fayetteville’s historic development. The narrative is supported by mapping drawn using the GIS (Geographical Information Systems) maintained by Onondaga County.

The report’s last section identifies themes (the National Register documentation provides many possibilities) of significance illustrated within the study area, provides conclusions drawn from the study, and recommends further actions for planning for the study area’s historic resources.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

5

DESCRIPTION OF EXISTING CONDITIONS

Physical and geopolitical setting: The Village of Fayetteville is centrally located in the town of Manlius. The town, in turn, lies on the eastern boundary of Onondaga County, New York, where it abuts the towns of Sullivan and Cazenovia in Madison County. Manlius is flanked on the north by the town of Cicero, on the west by the town of Dewitt, and on the south by the town of Pompey—all in Onondaga County. The City of Syracuse in Onondaga County lies less than five miles to the west.

The Town of Manlius encompasses land in two different geological regions that together characterize much of central and western New York. The southern part of Manlius lies at the northern edge of the Allegheny Plateau, a section of the larger Appalachian Highlands. This upland is made of generally level layers of siltstone, shale, and limestone, which were scored by glaciers retreating northward into narrow valleys divided by steep ridges. The northern section of Manlius lies in the Erie-Ontario Lowlands. The lowlands form an east-west band paralleling both the plateau to the south and Lake Ontario to the north. Portions of the lowlands region feature vast wetlands, and there are also rich alkaline soils and salt deposits formed by an ancient inland sea.

The Village of Fayetteville straddles a place where the Allegheny Plateau drops quickly from nearly 800' above sea level to the Erie-Ontario Lowlands at about 400 feet. The early upper village is located on the upland overlooking Limestone Creek. The lower village developed a short distance north of the gorge carved by the creek where it cuts through the plateau layers. Several similar streams in the larger region create, in geological terms, a dissected plateau. Over the lowlands, these streams follow meandering courses. Limestone Creek flows into Chittenango Creek northeast of Manlius Center. The Chittenango drains into Oneida Lake, a remnant of glacial Lake Iroquois, in the Lowland section just north of the town of Manlius. Sections of Bishop Brook, which rises southeast of the village on the plateau, flow around and through the eastern and northern parts of Fayetteville before emptying into Limestone Creek. Additional hydrological features in the region include two nearly circular meromictic lakes, now part of Green Lakes State Park in Manlius.

Spatial organization: The Town of Manlius lies in the Military Tract of Central New York, so named for its division and distribution *in lieu* of cash to men who fought in the continental army during the American Revolution. Before that conflict, the land lay in the Onondaga region of the larger Iroquois territory that spanned much of the Erie-Ontario Lowland area and spread some distance south onto the Allegheny Plateau. Most of the Military Tract, which spanned an area from the present Town of Manlius west and south to Seneca Lake and north to Lake Ontario, was divided using a rectilinear plat into 25 towns named mainly for a variety of classical poets and military figures. There were also two reservations named for Iroquois tribes, the Onondaga and the Cayuga. The first abutted the west boundary of Manlius and Pompey; the second wrapped both sides of the north end of Cayuga Lake. Like the tract itself, towns in the Military Tract also were divided on a rectilinear plan with as little regard for topography as the town plat. While this was a fairly easy procedure in the Lowland section, on the plateau the straight lines of the plat are often

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

6

at odds with the rolling terrain. Even so, surprisingly few adjustments were made to the initial plan. Fayetteville developed first along the boundary between Lots 65 and 75 of the Military Tract. It expanded north and south. Land later annexed lies in Lots 66 and 76 to the east and in Lot 74 to the west.

Circulation systems and settlement patterns: The early center of the Village of Fayetteville—sometimes referred to as the upper village—lies at the intersection of three highways—Genesee Street (NY 5), Manlius Street (NY 257), and Salt Springs Road—on rising land about a half-mile east of Limestone Creek. Genesee Street is part of the North Branch of the Seneca Turnpike (opened 1806), which was most important historic east-west route in the immediate area.

Manlius Street is a segment of a north-south trending route that connected Manlius Center to the north and the growing village of Manlius to the south. Manlius, in its turn, lay on the Third Great Western Turnpike (now mainly the alignment of US 20), an east-west route traversing the northern edge of the Allegheny Plateau and opened gradually during the first decade of the 1800s. Routes such as Manlius Street functioned as “laterals” connecting communities with the main east-west trade arteries. Salt Springs Road is a local route running east-southeast from the intersection of Genesee and Manlius streets. It forms a shallow, east-opening triangle with Genesee Street.

Paralleling the west bank of Limestone Creek, Highbridge Street formed another historic north-south lateral route. It connected mills upstream with the North Branch of the Seneca Turnpike and the canal feeder on the east bank of the creek. A little farther west, Burdick Street formed a four-corners intersection with the turnpike on the boundary between Military Tract Lots 64 and 65 north of Genesee Street and 74 and 75 south of Genesee Street.

In addition to the highway system that connects Fayetteville to places farther afield, there remains evidence of earlier water and rail connections. Limestone Creek was developed as a feeder for the Erie Canal, which was gradually opened between 1817 and 1825. Feeder canals helped maintain water levels in the artificial waterway in dry weather. Some, like the Limestone Creek Feeder, were also navigable for shallow draft boats. When completed, the Erie Canal connected the Port of New York with the Great Lakes navigation on Lake Erie at Buffalo, and the Limestone Creek Feeder provided Fayetteville with a very economical link to the main canal.

In addition to the Erie Canal feeder, the right-of-way of the Syracuse & Chenango Railroad, often called the Chenango Branch, can still be picked out in the eastern part of the village. It passes through a lumberyard (not located in the village, but nearly surrounded by it) where some historic-period buildings are oriented to its route. The right-of-way continues northwest, crossing Genesee Street, Bishop Brook, and Limestone Creek *en route* to its former junction with the New York Central Railroad east of the City of Syracuse. The rails have long since been taken up, but the right-of-way forms the back line of house lots in the Bishops Bluff and Wellwood Manor subdivisions and also part of the village boundary.

The internal street plan of the village of Fayetteville incorporates several different historic street development patterns. Genesee Street (NY 5) forms the main east-west thoroughfare through the village. This is crossed north-south by Manlius Street (NY 257). Salt Springs Road

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

7

meets this crossroads, entering it in the southeast quadrant and forms a five-point intersection in the historic “upper village.” Genesee Street descends about 100’ as it travels west to the floodplain of Limestone Creek. Mill Street south of Genesee Street parallels the creek; north of Genesee, it parallels the feeder for some distance before turning northeast and ascending to Manlius Street near where the latter route crosses Bishop Brook. The north section of Mill Street is now called Brooklea Drive, a name adopted in the 1920s or 1930s. The section of Genesee Street between Chapel Street and Brooklea Drive along with a few additional buildings in Limestone Plaza form the previously listed National Register Historic District.

The early village street plan east of Limestone Creek extended north one street to Elm Street east of Mill Street (Brooklea Drive) and paralleled Genesee Street. At the west end, adjacent to Mill Street, Mechanic Street parallels Elm Street as far as Center Street. Two additional cross streets—Edwards and Academy—form north-south connectors between Genesee and Elm.

Another early neighborhood with a rectilinear plat centers on Highbridge Street on the west side of Limestone Creek. This is bounded by the creek on the east, Genesee Street on the north, and South Burdick Street on the west. Highbridge Street was a turnpike in the early 1800s, and a tollgate still stood at the south edge of the village in 1874.

South of Genesee Street between Mill and Manlius streets, a grid plan was platted in the late 1840s. This section was known as the Ledyard Purchase and encompasses nearly all of this section of the village. The grid uses the orientation of the axes of the Military Tract lots and so is aligned nearly to the cardinal points. At the northern edge, the lotting accommodates the deep yards extending south from early Genesee Street properties. The covered channel carrying waters from Bishop Brook to several mill seats between Manlius Street and Limestone Creek passed through these yards just below the surface. The street plan and associated lotting south of this channel is truncated on the east side by the alignment of Manlius Street. On the west it conforms in straight courses to the bluff overlooking Limestone Creek and also to a mill canal opened ca.1837 that was known as Reilay’s Dyke.

Within these bounds, village blocks were laid out to accommodate the Ledyard Canal, which still descends in straight courses, making nearly right-angled turns, through this section of the village down to the creek. A small rectangular park called Washington Park was incorporated into the original plan. Green space was also planned around the large circular reservoir at the southeast corner of the Purchase and the semi-circular basin at the top of the canal. The latter is now called Cleveland Park. The Lowe Tract, a small neighborhood composed of small house lots with a variety of working class houses located on North and South streets abuts the south boundary of the Ledyard Purchase. This section was already partially developed by 1874, but was not annexed to the village until 1917 (date supplied by Town Historian Barbara Rivette. Later street development spreads out from these earlier, generally rectilinear areas in a variety of twentieth-century residential subdivisions. There are both strongly rectilinear plans and curvilinear ones. A few subdivisions combine both tendencies. Some can be accessed by a single road, while others offer several connections with the larger street plan.

Examples laid out between the two world wars were generally platted on undeveloped land that adjoined the larger historic street plan laid out before 1850. The earliest are Brooklea Heights

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

8

and Collincroft. The first simply subdivided the frontage on North Mill Street into village lots with narrow frontages and deep yards. This pattern was long established on varied scales from village lots to farm properties by the early 1800s. Collincroft—bounded southerly by Elm Street, westerly and northerly by Mill Street (now Brooklea Drive), and easterly by Manlius Street—exemplifies newer designs that emerged in the late 1800s. Collincroft’s curvilinear streets follow the rolling contours of the triangular parcel. Frontages vary in length, and lot footprints are irregular. This way of developing street plans created neighborhoods that feel very different from the orderly and often repetitive appearance of earlier sections of the village.

Huntleigh Park was also opened between the wars; its plan was later extended east in the early 1950s. Huntleigh Park is located east of the railroad between Genesee Street and Salt Spring Road. The earlier section occupies a nearly level site, and streets were laid out on a mainly rectilinear plan with rectangular house lots. Like Collincroft, it incorporates a tiny triangular park near the center of its plat.

After World War II Fayetteville rapidly expanded as a bedroom suburb of the City of Syracuse. Later annexations illustrate patterns popularized in the postwar era. Street plans are usually mildly to very curvilinear while house lots tend to be very similar in layout. While earlier subdivisions had been organized more like village blocks that allowed access from the established street plan, access to these new neighborhoods was generally limited, often to a single entrance. By 1970, land annexed for residential subdivision more than doubled the area of the village.

On a map, these newer sections of the village are easily identified as “lobes” annexed around the historic core of the village. They include Coakley Manor between Highbridge Street and Mott Road and Wellwood Manor, a single-access development east of South Manlius Street. Glenside (Cashin Drive) and Brookside, both north of East Genesee Street, flanked the main course of Bishop Brook and adjoined the wetlands west of the two meromictic lakes in Green Lakes State Park. East of Huntleigh Park, Maplewood and Pine Ridge opened between Genesee Street and Salt Springs Road, and Huntleigh Park itself expanded eastward. By the late 1960s, the first condominium development opened with The Orchard on the south side of Salt Springs Road. Additional areas including Briar Brook and the White Heron Circle section of Signal Hill, both on the Amos Tract, which had been annexed by the village in 1967. All of these subdivisions are discussed in the section “Review of Subdivisions.”

Architecture: The Village of Fayetteville encompasses approximately 1,800 properties with buildings. These represent a variety of architectural types built in styles characteristic and popular during all periods of Fayetteville’s development from the 1790s to the present. Of these, more than 800 properties retain buildings constructed during the historic period ending ca.1948. During the period ca.1948–1970, Fayetteville’s land area roughly doubled as the village began annexing large parcels that were being developed as residential subdivisions in that period. This subdivision development added more than 600 new house lots to the village. After 1970, that pace slowed, and the types of houses built diversified from single-family dwellings to a variety of multi-unit development including condominiums and small-scale apartment buildings as well.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

9

The vast majority of the village's infrastructure is composed of single-unit wood frame houses, but in all periods, commercial development and service buildings such as churches and schools, have also been constructed. Only a few buildings representing Fayetteville's significant industrial heritage survive. In addition to the parks integral to the original plats of the Ledyard Purchase, Collincroft, and Huntleigh Park, and the triangle park at the five-way intersection at the center of the village, Fayetteville preserves additional green spaces throughout the present plan. The once industrial area along the east bank of the Limestone Creek feeder and the island formed by the feeder is redeveloped as parkland with a variety of recreational opportunities. Coulter Park is located in the ravine between the Brookside and Glenside subdivisions. There are also three cemeteries: the large Fayetteville Cemetery on South Manlius Street, the small "pioneer" graveyard on Genesee Street east of Manlius, and the larger Roman Catholic cemetery farther east on Genesee.

Historic period architecture (ca.1792–1948)

The great majority of historic-period buildings in Fayetteville are wood frame, single-unit dwelling houses, although there are some nineteenth-century brick dwelling houses. These are located in areas of the village laid out as streets during this period and also along the main thoroughfares connecting the village to the larger trade and travel network. Nearly all buildings constructed before ca.1910 rest on stone foundations and occupy comparatively deep lots with narrow street frontages. Except on some properties developed initially as farms, the main building is almost always set close to the frontage. In areas within the historic village layout, this establishes coherent streetscapes of closely placed houses with similar setbacks even if houses span a range of dates and styles.

Stylistically, most historic-period houses in Fayetteville can be described as vernacular rather than high style examples of their taste, although there are also some quite large, highly developed examples of Greek Revival, Italianate, Queen Anne, Craftsman, and Colonial Revival buildings in several neighborhoods. There are also examples of houses expanded or remodeled in later historic tastes popular after their initial construction: these illustrate the increasing prosperity of Fayetteville homeowners in later periods.

The majority of the earliest and generally most stylish houses in Fayetteville are located within the small Genesee Street Hill-Limestone Plaza National Register Historic District (42 properties) concentrated on East Genesee Street between Limestone Creek and Academy and Chapel streets. The district includes an elegant brick Federal townhouse near the Manlius Corners intersection where the village first grew up as well as an early modest side-gabled example farther west. The latter illustrates the likely appearance of earlier houses, some of them are absorbed by later construction as back ells or wings. Others are lost altogether.

Beyond the historic district, additional early examples include the Federal brick townhouse with stepped gables at the southwest corner of Highbridge and Thompson streets west of Limestone Creek and the more vernacular brick Goodfellow house farther south on Highbridge. A few early houses also stand on North Manlius Street including two built by the Collin family. Additional examples of this type face Salt Springs Street. Except for the two brick townhouses, the

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

10

other houses outside the historic district were designed as the centerpieces and nerve centers of rural properties developed on sizable lots encompassing agricultural land.

The considerable number Greek Revival houses, which feature broader proportions and heavier trim schemes than the Federal taste, in Fayetteville represent the rapid growth and prosperity of the village beginning ca. 1835 and running through the Civil War. Many of these exemplify the “wing-and-upright” plan with two-story, three-bay frontal main blocks and a lower wing projecting from one eave wall. Additional service ells extend to the rear. Early examples face East Genesee Street; another is located on South Burdick Street west of the creek. A highly intact example with Ionic columns supporting its front porch faces west from the triangular intersection of East Genesee and Salt Springs streets. This house is designated as a local historic landmark.

While more well-to-do people built new houses and renovated existing ones in the Italianate taste that was popular by the mid-century, the proportions and trim schemes of the Grecian taste persisted for working class housing for nearly a generation longer. Short rows of modest houses built as worker housing—called tenements throughout the nineteenth century—feature typically “Greek” proportions. They are found in several locations the Ledyard Purchase and also adjacent to the former industrial and commercial district on the east bank of Limestone Creek north of Genesee on aptly named Mechanic Street and at the west end of Center Street. The most common form is a simple frontal-gable, two-bay main block, sometimes with a lower wing projecting from one eave wall. Trim is simple, often with a plain raking frieze. A few houses on Mechanic and Center streets are even simpler and more modest with side-gabled plans and narrow trim suggesting a Federal aesthetic dating to the early development of the lime and tanning industries adjacent.

As the Renaissance-inspired Italianate taste increased in popularity during the third quarter of the century, it was adopted more broadly. Individual ownership histories illustrate patterns of tradition and innovation, so that several houses in the previously designated National Register Historic District illustrate how people altered rooflines and added brackets and porches to earlier dwellings or simply built a different house. These designs and alterations extend outward from the closely confined historic district to houses on Elm, Center, and Manlius streets. The Levi Snell house (416 Brooklea Dr) at the corner of North Manlius Street and Brooklea Drive—the only individual National Register-listed property in Fayetteville—exemplifies the common pattern of transition from Greek Revival to Italianate. The house features the massing and proportions characteristic of the earlier taste and is embellished with the details of the emerging one.

Fayetteville exhibits a variety of Italianate houses. Some are large stylish examples such as the large brick house overlooking Limestone Plaza from Genesee Street and elegant wood frame rural examples including one used as the village’s Wortley Senior Center on Salt Springs Road and another on East Genesee Street adjacent to the later Maplewood subdivision. At least two large elaborate examples facing Manlius Street—Wellwood on the site of Wellwood School and another at the northeast corner of Genesee Street—have been demolished. A row of sizable Italianate dwelling houses faces Clinton Street in the Ledyard Purchase. These illustrate the common nineteenth-century pattern of managers living within walking distance to the mills where they worked. These houses feature the decorative hallmarks of the style: deep eaves supported by heavy

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

11

brackets, open porches and verandas and fenestration plans, usually symmetrical, with large windows set in Renaissance-taste frames. The taste is not especially common in more modestly scaled houses.

Only one house (109 East Genesee St) in Fayetteville illustrates the Gothic Revival taste that offered a Romantic alternative to the Greek Revival and early Italianate. Although later enhanced with a Queen Anne porch and bay window on the front façade and doubled in footprint in the late 1800s, the street façade retains a fully developed decorative scheme with crockets, the characteristic steeply pitched roofs, and pointed Gothic windows featuring traceries.

Fayetteville exhibits a variety of houses designed in the eclectic styles—Eastlake, Queen Anne, and Stick Style—popular during the last two decades of the 1800s and into the early 1900s. Rather than forming neighborhoods, these generally fill lots that remained open in the historic street plan in the late 1800s. Large, stylish examples, some retaining the forms of these tastes, but not the variety of fanciful trim schemes, face South Manlius Street and a section of East Genesee Street east of Manlius Street. Several sizable examples stand at the east end of Elm Street, within easy walking distance of the historic commercial district one block south. Additional eclectic style houses face Washington Park in the Ledyard Purchase area.

These tastes also influenced the design of middle-class housing in this period. Roof pitches are steepened from the low profiles of the Italianate. On a more modest scale, footprints are more complex, and decorative schemes feature varied fenestration and articulated surfaces. In addition to building new houses, owners of older houses added eclectic style details to older houses. Open porches wide enough to accommodate furniture that created additional living space, partially enclosed sleeping porches (typically on sides or rear of the house), and three-sided bay windows were common additions. Altering fenestration details was a comparatively inexpensive way to update a house. Starting with the front façade, people enlarged, or replaced two openings with a single one to accommodate a large single-light sash topped by a decorative transom. Some people also replaced earlier multi-light window sash with two-over-twos or one-over-ones. These historic-period renovations are evident throughout the area platted by the 1870s.

The process of infill on open lots in the historic street plan, especially at the periphery, continued into the first quarter of the 1900s. Mainly modest bungalows were built south of the Ledyard Dyke, at the lower (south) end of Brooklea Drive on the west side, and on Highbridge Street. Larger, more developed examples face Lincoln Avenue and South Manlius Street, and an unusually large and highly intact example stands on a large lot on the south side of Salt Springs Road. Houses designed using the related American Four-square plan are more unusual.

As housing tastes shifted to Colonial Revival, Dutch Colonial, Tudor Revival in the 1920s and 1930s, some new houses were built in new residential subdivisions in Collincroft, Brooklea Heights, and Huntleigh Park. A few new, not very large, but individually designed, houses using these new tastes were built on Linden Avenue. Early houses in Huntleigh Park include a few bungalows and cottages on Oakwood Street, but story-and-a-half “capes” and two-story “colonials” predominated through the western section of Huntleigh Park that was opened about 1920.

Three of the five historic-period churches mapped in 1874 remain in the historic district on East Genesee Street. Two are masonry buildings that replaced earlier wood frame buildings in

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

12

the mid-1800s and feature designs based in the medieval European tradition. The United Church of Fayetteville (formerly the Presbyterian church) is a brick Romanesque Revival building with a central tower and spire. Trinity Episcopal is a stone example with a corner tower designed in the English parish church tradition. This once had a spire. The third (formerly Methodist, and reused for residential units) features stuccoed walls (over a wood frame) and gable ends resembling Dutch townhouse architecture with shallow steps adorning its gable ends.

Historic-period commercial buildings in Fayetteville form two clusters. Large three-story brick buildings built during the second quarter of the nineteenth century face Limestone Plaza, the old route over the creek, and the south end of Brooklea Drive. This alignment of Genesee Street was altered in 1954 by a bridge on a straighter alignment that carries Genesee Street about 20 feet above the grade of the plaza. Later-built Italianate commercial buildings wrap the adjacent section of Brooklea Drive for a short distance. Some writers have called this the “lower village,” but this term does not designate a separate municipality.

The second commercial cluster, where Manlius Corners, sometimes referred to as the “upper village” is located farther east on East Genesee Street near the village hall (site of an earlier union school). Nineteenth-century buildings in this cluster are greatly remodeled, however, and there are several post-1948 buildings that replace earlier ones. This includes the Mid-Century Modern supermarket on the south side of the street and another much-altered example at the southwest corner of Manlius and Salt Springs Street. Crossing Manlius Street, a bank with a stone veneer façade and drive-through on its rear (east) wall built ca.1970 faces the little triangle known as Memorial Park and replaces the brick Catholic church.

A third commercial area, now altered by the 1954 realignment of the Genesee Street bridge over Limestone Creek, developed as an extension or as part of the district now represented mainly by the buildings on Limestone Plaza. A few modest houses built before 1900 and small mid-twentieth-century commercial buildings face the old highway, which now flows into Genesee Street at the lighted intersection at Highbridge Street.

Of Fayetteville’s historic industrial architecture, buildings constructed by two companies survive. The wood-shingle-clad Stickley factory, which now houses the Fayetteville Free Library, is composed of narrow, gable-roofed rectangular blocks of two and three stories. Its regular fenestration retains many of its multi-light double-hung wood sash. This turn-of-the-century facility adjoins the Ledyard Dyke and made wood furniture using waterpower and also steam well into the 1900s. A large parking lot extends north to Orchard Street. The former, now disused, Precision Castings manufacturing facility at 400 Clinton is an L-plan complex with load-bearing masonry walls. Its Moderne-style buff brick north façade features ribbons of windows and multi-light metal frame windows in a low corner tower housing the canopied main entrance.

The Village of Fayetteville incorporates several properties with civic buildings, structures, and sites. The Georgian Revival brick village hall (built 1938) with stepped gable end chimneys and symmetrical fenestration is located on the north side of East Genesee Street near the intersection with Manlius Street. Later-added side-gabled wings with gabled dormers flank the earlier five-bay building. The firehouse (added 2011), which mimics the village hall fenestration and form on a larger scale, adjoins the east wing of the village hall with four garage bays capped by

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

13

a pent roof facing Genesee Street. Wellwood School (built 1932), a large two-story brick Georgian Revival structure on a full-story raised basement, stands on a large grassy site at the south end of the village facing South Manlius Street at the corner of Lincoln Avenue. This is the only surviving academic structure in the village, and it continues in use as a middle school for the Fayetteville-Manlius School District. The adjacent Huntington Beard Park containing the circular reservoir built to supply a steady flow to the Ledyard Dyke is on the north side of Lincoln Avenue.

The village owns additional parks within the historic street plan. Washington Park is a green space within the original Ledyard Purchase plan. It is set in the residential district south of the dyke between North and South Park streets and Chapel and Walnut streets. It now incorporates playground equipment and benches. Farther north and east, Cleveland Memorial Park is a narrow sliver of land east of Chapel Street that forms a screen for houses facing the Precision Castings factory opposite. This, too, is part of the original Ledyard Purchase plat. A semi-circular basin located here featured control gates for the mill seats, or water lots, located farther down the canal, or dyke. Small memorial parks occupy the triangular parcel between East Genesee and Salt Springs streets and the parcel east of the firehouse running to North Manlius Street. Lafayette Park is located in the triangle formed by Collin Avenue and Linden Lane in the Collincroft, or Brooklea Heights subdivision opened in the 1920s. Along the creek, some open lots once occupied by industrial properties in the 1800s are now also parkland.

Three historic cemeteries also offer green space within the village boundary. The oldest of these is a small parcel east of the five-corners intersection. This small plot retains about twenty individual stones dating mainly to the first quarter of the nineteenth century. The largest cemetery (21 acres) in Fayetteville was labeled as a rural cemetery in 1874 (expanded and incorporated in 1864 from an earlier graveyard and owned by the village). It fits the pattern of development where burying grounds were moved to periphery of densely settled areas and designed as pleasant places to walk and visit. This site features slightly rolling ground with mature trees and family plots arranged in a park-like setting along curvilinear paths. Its frontage on South Manlius Street is enclosed by a stone wall with circular gateposts with domed caps. The Immaculate Conception (Roman Catholic) cemetery lies on the south side of East Genesee Street west of the former railroad right-of-way. It occupies a smaller parcel than the one on Manlius Street, and burials are more densely placed along its curvilinear circulation plan. Like the village cemetery, Immaculate Conception features numerous mature trees and a similar stone wall.

Postwar architecture (ca.1948–70)

Postwar construction in Fayetteville is almost entirely related to the rapid development of the village as residential suburb of Syracuse. The independence of individual auto travel and space to park cars surely influenced the decision of one manufacturer and two churches in Fayetteville to move to the periphery and build new Mid-Century Modern edifices surrounded by open land that offered space for parking. Their buildings embraced the use of innovative postwar materials in new design paradigms. Precision Castings built its new manufacturing facility built on East Genesee Street adjacent to the Chenango Branch tracks in 1952 to replace its old factory on the Ledyard Canal. Two churches, the Methodist and Catholic, sold their sites near the five-point intersection in the village during the 1960s and moved east of Manlius Street. The Methodists

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

14

built their new Mid-century Modern church on a large lot adjoining the new Glenside subdivision. The Catholics built in the same taste a church, a school, and other facilities on a large parcel south of Salt Springs Road that could be reached also from the Wellwood Manor subdivision. Both church sites offered ample parking lots, and they illustrate the suburbanization of churches in the postwar era and offer intact examples of the type.

The commercial districts centered on the five-point intersection and adjacent to Limestone Creek changed greatly in this period. At the upper, or east end, of Genesee Street near the Manlius Street intersection, post-war commercial buildings now mingled with altered buildings constructed in the historic period. The latter were generally stripped of historic trim schemes and their street-level fenestration altered. A small pedestrian mall still marked by a supermarket's vertical marquis was built between Spring and Chapel streets. New buildings, some featuring the recognizable iconography of specific businesses such as Friendly's Ice Cream (opened 1971) line the north side of East Genesee Street for a short distance east of Manlius Street. A small pedestrian mall projects north in this commercial district, which ends at a large convenience store (opened after 1970). A disused car dealership with a large service garage behind stands on the south side of Genesee Street east of the railroad right-of-way. The earliest part of this building was mapped by 1943; the showroom was added a little later.

The commercial area adjoining the old bridge is generally representative of the pre-1948 period, but with the altered bridge and highway alignment of Genesee Street, new businesses with characteristic one-story, flat-roofed commercial buildings and glass fronts opened alongside the new four-lane access. Car washes, restaurants, and other stores built in this period still comprise "strip development" along this entry to the village.

New commercial strips, new churches, and new businesses were generally located near much of the new housing constructed in the same period. New housing was almost entirely constructed in newly platted residential subdivisions at the periphery of the village that were opened on previously agricultural land surrounding the village center. Houses built in subdivisions tend to be set back farther from the street than those built on traditional village house lots. Their lots were generally wider to accommodate garages and often shallower. The lack of sidewalks compensated for the depth.

While builders continued to use colonial designs in the post-war period, Mid-Century Modern designs were adopted by others. These designs featured lower, often single-story, massing. They took advantage of technologies new to domestic architecture such as trusses and plate glass to create ribbons of windows and clear span interiors. Fully developed examples in this radically different idiom are unusual in Fayetteville. A few face Bishop Drive located at the east end of the new expansion of Huntleigh Park. Additional modest examples stand in Wellwood Manor opened south of the cemetery and east of South Manlius Street and in the northern streets of Collincroft.

"Ranch" and "split-level" house designs—both simplified versions of more complicated Mid-Century Modern designs—are ubiquitous in subdivisions opened in the period ca.1948–70. The Griffin Farm Tract opened between North Burdick Street and Limestone Creek features once identical ranch houses built on concrete slabs and on a very modest scale. Coakley Manor

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

15

between Highbridge Street and Mott Road features slightly larger, more varied examples of the type. The east side of Mott Road, however, is lined by mainly identical houses. Glenside (Cashin Drive) features once-identical ranch houses constructed on a single cul-de-sac. Adjacent Brookside encompasses nearly 200 dwellings, many of them ranch houses, although there are also split-levels and some two-story colonials. A similar variety prevails through most of the eastern postwar extension of Huntleigh Park. Gleasonwood, just north of Bishop's Bluff, features very similar two-story houses with attached two-bay garages, another pattern regularly repeated in cul-de-sac subdivisions constructed during the 1960s and 1970s in Fayetteville. Over the past half-century or so, many owners have extended the house over the garage, altered the entrance porch arrangements, and replaced many exterior finishes, which now differentiates the appearances of the houses.

By the 1960s, some builders were meeting a demand for multi-unit housing. When part of the Precision Castings plant burned in 1962, it was replaced with three two-story apartment buildings arranged in a U around a courtyard. This rather plainly designed group echoes slightly the International Style popular for schools and civic buildings of the time. The three-story, hip-roofed stuccoed hospital wing of the former Maplecrest Camp, a sanitarium opened in the 1920s at the south end of Warren Street, was opened about the same time.

Post-1970

Subdivision development continued in Fayetteville after 1970 although at a slower rate and without further annexation. The Amos Tract (1967) at the east end of the village is the last annexation in Fayetteville, and it lay undeveloped for about a decade before building in Signal Hill north of Genesee Street and Briar Brook south of Genesee began. A few lots are still open in the latter. By the 1970s, housing design was moving away from the plain ranch and split-level designs so ubiquitous in the 1950s and 1960s to more varied plans with a variety of embellishments drawn from various historic idioms.

Two divergent architectural design patterns emerged. Single-unit houses tended to be larger and more elaborate with more articulated surfaces and varied fenestration in schemes unified by construction materials and repeated massing and fenestration. These are set on larger lots with deeper setbacks. Access to these later developments is even more limited relative to the number of lots. The western section of Signal Hill, the upper section of Briar Brook, and Aladdin Drive adjacent to Brookside illustrate this more recent tendency.

In contrast, condominium development—where the surrounding land is managed by an overarching entity and exterior appearances are highly controlled—appealed to others. The Orchard was the first example of the latter. Additional modest examples line parts of Highbridge Street and the lower section of Briar Brook and Signal Hill. Low-rise, mainly two-story multi-unit examples are located on a few historic manufacturing sites along the Ledyard Dyke and also on the lower ends of Mill and Washington streets are infill, as are the houses being built in 2018 on the former paper mill site. The northern section of the Briar Brook subdivision on the Amos Tract at the east end of the village offer a more rural feel as does the eastern portion of Signal Hill with its curvilinear road system and rolling landscape dotted by clusters of mature trees.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

16

While a few lots remained open within the historic core of Fayetteville in 1970, most now feature infill housing. This includes late examples of ranch and Mid-Century modern single-family dwellings south of Franklin Street, where lumber was once stored for the Stickley factory, and in the south part of the Ledyard Purchase. Tremain Drive was annexed ca.1970, and houses were built on the sizable lots there soon after.

Finally, when the village opened its own sewer system in 1972 in connection with the county-operated Meadowbrook-Limestone Treatment Plant sourced from Lake Ontario opened, the treatment plant required for the Brookside development was taken off line. Its site in the ravine of Bishop Brook where Glenside's Cashin Lane was extended to meet the Brookside subdivision was redesigned as a park named for Wilbur Coulter, mayor from 1959 to 1969, and opened in 1976.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

17

HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

Settlement Period (1792–ca. 1830)

The Village of Fayetteville is located in the southern part of Lot numbers 64, 65, and 66 and the northern portions of 74, 75, and 76 in the Town of Manlius in the Military Tract of Central New York. The 1,750,000-acre tract was named for its use as bounty land distributed to men who fought in the Continental Army during the Revolution. The tract was proposed by the state in March 1781 as an incentive to raise troops in New York State for the duration of the fight against the British. Land was not set aside until the late 1780s, five or six years after the Treaty of Paris ending hostilities was signed in September 1783. The land forming the Military Tract lay in Onondaga and Cayuga territory west of the Line of Property established in 1768 beyond which the British crown had agreed to not patent lands. In 1788 and 1789 the state of New York made treaties with the Onondaga and the Cayuga by which both tribes' title to their lands were extinguished except for reservations for each within the Military Tract boundary. The survey of the tract into 25 towns named mainly for figures important in Classical history was carried out in 1789, and lots were drawn to distribute the lands two years later. Some recipients sold their claims, having long since settled elsewhere; others settled on their claims.

Cyrus Kinne is generally named as the first settler in the section of Fayetteville called by some writers the "upper village" where the early highway called Salt Springs Road meets Manlius Street. The latter route was described as early as 1794 in the Manlius town highway book as the road going from "Mr. Cunningham's house" (in Manlius village) to the "Salt Springs Road south of Cyrus Kinney, Esq."² When the North Branch of the Seneca Turnpike opened in 1806, it offered a lower elevation alternative to the original route, which connected Chittenango, Manlius, Onondaga Valley, Onondaga Hill, Marcellus, and Willow Glen.³ Its route is now East Genesee Street in the Village of Fayetteville, and it forms the dominant east-west route along which Fayetteville grew. The three roads form the distinctive five-point intersection around which a hamlet called by some Manlius Four Corners (even though there are five corners) and by others simply Manlius at the time.

Horatio Gates Spafford described it in his 1813 gazetteer, saying: "There is also another [settlement] vaguely called Manlius, though rather as the centre of the Town than as a Village." This differed both from Manlius Square, where the heavily traveled Third Great Western and Seneca turnpikes met, now the Village of Manlius, and Manlius Center. The latter was an early hamlet on the lowlands farther north that has all but vanished. Spafford went on to describe the considerable manufacturing interests located between the present day villages of Manlius and Fayetteville, noting that the latter was on "the border of a deep gulf through which flows Limestone creek." Manufacturing included 4 grain mills, 5 saw mills, 2 fulling mills, 2 carding

² Barbara Rivette, Synopsis: "Route 257/Fayetteville-Manlius Road," 1 August 2006.

³ Rivette, Synopsis: "North Branch of the Seneca Turnpike, or Genesee St," 29 June 2018.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

18

machines, 2 nail factories, an oil mill, and a cotton and woolen factory.”⁴ Those exporting their production were oriented to the turnpike junction at Manlius Square, the settlement incorporated as the Village of Manlius under state charter in 1813. By then, it was already a sizable community with about 150 “buildings of every description.”

The “settlement vaguely called Manlius” was formally named Fayetteville when it gained a post office in 1818.⁵ About the same time, the state canal commission chose Limestone Creek as a feeder for the Erie Canal. Canal engineers used natural watercourses crossed by the new canal’s ditch to supply feeder canals controlled by guard locks to help maintain water levels on the main route. Some feeders like the one on Limestone Creek were also navigable. The new post office at Fayetteville offered an important communication exchange between the artificial waterway and interior settlements. In the area that soon developed as a second commercial area along the creek, the “Little Creek” was dug and dammed to create the feeder. This formed the island in the creek over which the bridge—replaced a few times in the interim—carrying the North Branch of the Seneca Turnpike (now Genesee St) still passes.

The feeder was reported complete in the annual Canal Commissioners Report in 1825.⁶ It formed a crossroads between an important land route and a connection to the new Erie Canal, often called the Grand Canal by writers of the time, and it immediately expanded economic opportunity for the tiny post village of Fayetteville. Sections of the canal opened for business as early as 1820, allowing the state to earn toll revenue that supported further construction. Sections in Onondaga County opened before the entire canal opened in 1825, and freight may have traveled on the Limestone Creek feeder before its opening was recorded. The limekilns of Reuben Bangs located north of the Seneca Turnpike on the Limestone Creek feeder may have opened several years earlier—some secondary sources say in 1818—to supply hydraulic cement to the canal contractors working on both the feeder and the main trunk.⁷ This form of cement is made from a particular type of argillaceous limestone, and it was used to line the prism of the canal and also for masonry because it sets quickly and firmly, even under water.

When Spafford published his second gazetteer in 1824, his correspondent still reported no commercial establishments, mills, factories, or meetinghouses at the post-village of Fayetteville located two miles north of Manlius, although it had grown to 25 houses.⁸ In contrast, the Village of Manlius had continue growing and now had about 200 buildings including 100 dwelling houses, three churches, a Masonic Lodge, a printing office, a cotton factory, and “a great deal of

⁴ Horatio Gates Spafford. *Gazetteer of State of New York, etc.* (Albany: H.C. Southwick, 1813): 234.

⁵ <https://webpmt.usps.gov/pmt013.cfm>.

⁶ Craig S. Williams. *A History of the Erie Canal near Fayetteville, New York*. (Typescript, n.d.): 5. William was quoting from the Canal Commissioners Report, A.D. #49, 1826.

⁷ Charles S. Newman. “Memories of Fayetteville.” Typescript. Prepared ca.1940 and available at http://www.everingham.com/family/data2/fayetteville_memo.html. This date coincides with the letting of contracts in the region, so it may be accurate, but I have not located a primary source to corroborate this anecdotal secondary source.

⁸ Horatio Gates Spafford. *Gazetteer of State of New York, etc.* (Albany: B.D. Packard, 1824): 304. Williams suggests that there were at least a few stores, and, there were, of course, the limekilns. Spafford’s correspondent may have relied on earlier information and only counted houses.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

19

hydraulic (water-powered industry), mechanical, and trading businesses.”⁹ This offers a picture of a thriving inland turnpike village moments before the opening of the artificial waterway shifted the economy to much less costly waterborne freight. In areas with good access to the Erie Canal, local economies exploded in the late 1820s. By the early 1830s, however, turnpikes in some areas were being “thrown open,” their tollgates abandoned due to reduced revenues to remunerate their shareholders and maintain infrastructure. As an example, the Third Great Western Turnpike, one of the most successful turnpike companies in central New York and a major route through the Village of Manlius, eventually failed in 1859, but toll receipts had fallen from an 1815 high of \$12,322 to just \$5,079 in 1824, even before the canal was fully open.¹⁰ It was more economical to move freight to the canal by the shortest good route than to move it overland any more distance than was necessary.

Some turnpike villages like Fayetteville and Manlius, which were not located along the main canal route, soon turned to the question of how to connect with or improve their connection with the artificial waterway. Entrepreneurs in both places chartered companies they hoped would aid their economies. Fayetteville was more successful than Manlius in its efforts. It had the advantage of being at the end of the state’s Limestone Creek feeder. Manlius was at a further disadvantage as it was a few miles farther away and at higher elevation. The latter made slackwater navigation challenging as it required lift locks.

An article in the 18 December 1830 number of the *Manlius Repository* announced that a proposal to form a corporation that would build a railroad (horse-drawn, similar to rail carts use in mining operations of the time) connecting Fayetteville with the canal would be presented in the legislative session the following spring. The railroad was never built. A short, privately funded extension of the feeder, however, was proposed and built by Fayetteville men of business John McVicar, Hervey Edwards, and Seymour Pratt. This brought the feeder a little farther south into the emerging commercial district and established the basin south of the turnpike crossing. Dates of its completion vary, but it was surely open by 1833 when the owners of the extension urged the state to acquire the private section, its guard lock, and the recently built dry dock on the west bank. In arguing their case, they wrote that Fayetteville was “a place of considerable business, where a large amount of property is put on board of boats to send to market and where a large amount of merchandize [sic] is landed for the surrounding country.”¹¹

In spite of this, or perhaps because Fayetteville was very successful in years to come, little of its built environment dating to this early period survives in recognizable form. Some of its early buildings are surely incorporated in later structures as wings and ells on later dwelling houses or reused as outbuildings. Some were burned in training exercises by the fire department in the 1900s.¹² The transportation framework from which the village would radiate in coming decades is the most evident physical survival of this era.

⁹ Spafford (1824), 304.

¹⁰ *The Freeman’s Journal* (Cooperstown), reprinted from the *Cazenovia Republican*, 18 March 1859. This article provides toll revenues collected from the canal commission throughout the period.

¹¹ Williams, 7–8.

¹² Rivette, Comments provided to author by letter, 5 July 2018.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

20

Erie Canal Village (ca.1830–1849)

The opening of the feeder canal drawn off the upper reaches of Limestone Creek generated opportunities for commercial growth that drew new residents to Fayetteville. It rapidly became a point of exchange, and Gordon's *Gazetteer for 1836* recorded triple the number of dwelling houses counted just a dozen years earlier by Spafford. Seventy-five houses were associated with one gristmill, one sawmill, four taverns, and six stores.¹³ One or both mills were known as the Fayetteville Mills and located south of Genesee Street alongside a dyke drawn off Limestone Creek. When sold in 1837 to John G. Reilay of Troy and Adna Treat of Geneva for \$1,900, the previous owners were John Sprague, Hiram Wood, and Jonathan G. Rowling.¹⁴ The selling price indicates that it was a successful operation, and both Reilay and Treat soon moved to Fayetteville, as shown by later deeds, to run it. Curiously, the limekilns went unmentioned in early gazetteers, although other evidence documents their existence and location. Perhaps Fayetteville was still viewed mainly as a commercial rather than an industrial center in this period.

By 1836, Fayetteville went from being a “village with four taverns and no meetinghouses”—, an often-quoted, but never cited description of the growing hamlet—to one with four churches.¹⁵ Surely the description was meant to suggest that Fayetteville was more of a rough-and-tumble canal port than a community of refined and established residents. Churches were viewed as markers of community stability, and so gazetteers of the period tracked their establishment. The Baptist society registered its formation in the Onondaga County Clerk's office on 17 February 1819, but didn't construct its first church for about a decade. The first meetinghouse was dedicated in July 1831.¹⁶ The Methodists built their first church in 1829.¹⁷ The Presbyterian congregation organized in the early 1820s and built its first meetinghouse in 1830.¹⁸ That year, an Episcopal society organized. It dedicated its new Trinity Church in 1832.¹⁹ All four exemplified the wood frame meetinghouse form still common in New England and central New York in the 1820s and 1830s. They faced each other across the Seneca Turnpike in the area just west of its intersection with Manlius Street and formed the visual nucleus of this part of the village in this period.

¹³ Thomas F. Gordon, *Gazetteer of the state of New York: comprehending its colonial history; general geography, geology, and internal improvements; its political state; a minute description of tis several counties, towns, and villages ... with a map of the state, and a map of each county, and plans of the cities and principal villages*. (Philadelphia: printed for author, 1836): 581.

¹⁴ *Book of Deeds* 65/page 465. (Syracuse, New York: Onondaga County Clerk's Office). Subsequent deed references take the form ##/##.

¹⁵ Gordon, 581.

¹⁶ W.W. Clayton, *History of Onondaga County, New York with Illustrations and Biographical Sketches*. (Syracuse, New York: D. Mason & Co., 1878): 371.

¹⁷ Rivette, Comments provided to author by letter, 5 July 2018.

¹⁸ Clayton, 373.

¹⁹ Clayton, 373. Many secondary sources state the name was chosen because early church furnishings were provided by Trinity Church, Wall Street, in New York City, but Rivette states that a recently prepared and “carefully researched history (2017) finds no evidence” of this assertion. Clayton, one of the earlier secondary sources, did not supply this information.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

21

The village gained an academy incorporated by the legislature in May 1837 and chartered by the Regents of New York State about two years later in February 1839.²⁰ Academies were private institutions. In this period, they were generally found in villages with strong or at least developing economies led by men of New England descent. Academies usually had classical curricula that beyond the minimal 3Rs taught in common, or public district, schools. Academy Street in Fayetteville is named for the one adjacent to the wealthy neighborhood that was developing by the 1830s along Genesee Street between the upper and lower commercial districts. In the early 1840s, a small stone common school was built at the northeast corner of Center and Elm streets adjoining the working class district descending the slope to the creek and feeder north of the turnpike.²¹

By the early 1830s, neighborhoods were emerging in Fayetteville. The 1840 census recorded 800 residents living in 120 dwelling houses. The most desirable residential section in Fayetteville was already established facing the segment of Genesee Street between the upper and lower commercial districts with the churches at its east end. Here large houses, mainly handsome, wood frame Greek Revival dwellings were set back on deep lots. Those on the north side extended to the back lines of more modest lots on Elm Street, where smaller examples in similar taste had filled many properties. Those on the south side of Genesee generally feature deeper lots that descend into the hollow to the south. As a group these form the majority of the present National Register Historic District. They were insulated, but adjacent to, the hurly-burly of the upper and lower commercial districts. The former was marked by a cluster of early taverns and hotels arrayed around the five-point Manlius Street intersection. The latter was a busy canalside commercial area with stores, residential hotels, the canal basin, and dry dock.

Neighborhoods with smaller, less stylish wood frame houses developed on rectilinear streets adjacent to the limekilns area on the west end of Elm Street, and aptly named Mechanic Street. Here, there are still diminutive side-gabled examples and somewhat larger, often gable-fronted houses on narrow lots. A few more houses of similar type lined Mill Street south of the turnpike. There were also house lots facing Genesee Street west of the creek as far as Burdick Street. Additional houses lined another squarely laid out neighborhood between Highbridge and South Burdick streets, which then extended south on Highbridge paralleling the bank of Limestone Creek. There are very few intact Federal-era buildings in Fayetteville because until the 1830s, there were only a few dozen dwellings at all. A handsome brick Federal townhouse is located in the upper village, and another, partially altered, stands at the southwest corner of Highbridge and Thompson streets west of the creek. There are additional side-gabled houses around which early farms were developed on all of the main highways including the brick Goodfellow house on Highbridge Street, the Collin houses on North Manlius Street, and a few more on Genesee Street and Salt Springs Road east of Manlius Street.

By the mid-1830s local entrepreneurs were eager to also expand industrial opportunity in Fayetteville. On the east bank of Limestone Creek, the land fell an ample 100 feet from Manlius

²⁰ J.H. French, *Gazetteer of the State of New York, embracing a comprehensive view of the Geography, Geology, and General History of the State.* ([Syracuse: G.P. Smith], 1860): 131.

²¹ Rivette, *Glimpses of Fayetteville* (Fayetteville, New York: Village of Fayetteville, 1994): 6.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

22

Street to the watercourse, but there was no naturally occurring streams to harness for power. William M. Redfield is said to have urged engineering a channel, or power canal, to drive mills by drawing water off of a stream descending northerly off the Allegheny Plateau.²² At the state legislative session on 15 March 1836, the Fayetteville Hydraulic Company was chartered to canalize some of the flow of Limestone Creek upstream and draw it over the fall in the village to reenter the creek at lower elevation. The company directors were David Collin, Albert Neeley, John Watson, Hervey Edwards, John McVicar, Jacob dePuy, and John Yelverton. Its capitalization limit was set at \$70,000. Before the corporation could divert water from the creek, it was required to purchase “the right to do so, from the several owners of lands and mill privileges affected thereby, and from the several owners of lands through which the said water is to be conducted.”²³

For nearly a decade, however, the company was apparently ineffective in executing its chartered purpose. Disturnell’s *Gazetteer for 1842* recorded the same flouring mill, two sawmills, and a tannery—an increase of one sawmill and a tannery over those noted by Gordon in 1836. In 1844, Anson H. Bangs, who was not a director of the canal company, ventured on a potentially competing plan to develop water power when he built a dam on Bishop Brook to draw water over the descending land south of Genesee Street to Limestone Creek. He had also built a reservoir east of Manlius Street to impound the water drawn off.²⁴ This may have prompted David Collin, one of the directors of the canal company, to convince Jonathan B. Ledyard of Cazenovia to finance the canal company.²⁵ Ledyard, a descendant of General Benjamin Ledyard (1753–1803), who served as the first land agent for the Central New York Military Tract, was both well off and well versed in such affairs.

Ledyard executed 27 deeds in his own name between the first of April and the first week of June 1845 to secure lands and rights for two projects: the Limestone Creek canal, now usually called the Ledyard Dyke, or Canal, and the Bishop Brook aqueduct. These legal instruments include rights-of-way and compensation for potential damages across lands to be crossed in Military Lot nos. 75, 76, 85, and 86 between Halls Mills and two reservoirs planned on Lot 75 to impound water for the new hydraulic canal drawn off Limestone Creek and key rights to secure the power channel partially undertaken on Bishop Brook against competition.²⁶ Ledyard also purchased more than 115 acres of land in Lot 75 from the back lines of properties facing the south side of Genesee Street south nearly to the present village boundary and almost all land between

²² John T. Houlihan, *A History of the Ledyard Dyke (Fayetteville Hydraulic Canal)*. Typescript. 1977. (located in Village archives): 3. Houlihan cites a 7 December 1917 article in the *Fayetteville Recorder*.

²³ <http://www.waterworkshistory.us/NY/Fayetteville/1836NYchap48.pdf>.

²⁴ 88/159.

²⁵ Houlihan, 3. He is quoting newspaper articles rather than primary sources. These may, in turn, be relying on one another rather than on a primary source. It seems likely that one of the directors did take the lead, however, and whether it was Collin or someone else is of less significance than the fact of its being undertaken.

²⁶ For Limestone Creek dyke: 88/109; 88/154; 88/155; 88/157; 88/158; 88/160; 88/161; 88/162; 88/163; 88/165; 88/166; 88/167; 90/3; 90/308. For Bishop Brook project: 88/156; 88/157; 88/159; 88/163; 88/165. In several instances, more than one deed is recorded on the same page, leading to apparent duplication of references. Each reference, however, cites a different deed.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

23

Limestone Creek and Manlius Street.²⁷ These lands encompass the section of the village described in deeds and mapped as the Ledyard Purchase.²⁸ In the same period, he also secured crucial parcels and infrastructure for the partially developed Bishop Brook channel. These deeds protected his sizable investment in the Limestone Creek project from competition.

On the 13th of June 1845, Ledyard and the canal company signed the agreement that allowed work to begin.²⁹ The same day, Ledyard also executed a deed with John G. Reilay, whose Fayetteville Mills stood to be affected by the new canal.³⁰ Five days after that, on 18 June, the company called for construction bids on the Limestone canal in the *Onondaga Standard*. Construction began on 4 July with a groundbreaking ceremony.³¹ This rapid-fire timetable indicates that the Limestone Creek project was already planned and simply required execution.

It seems the Bishop Brook project was not so far progressed. Ledyard focused on the Limestone Creek project and left securing the remaining quit claim deeds and a few parcels for the Bishop Brook project as late as July 1849.³² Maps prepared in 1849 show that the aqueduct was a winding and narrow affair that followed low lying land on the south side of John Street, passed under Spring Street and continued westerly, passing through the backs of the very deep house lots on the south side of Genesee Street.³³ It flowed through a subterranean wood pipe nearly four feet in diameter made of wood staves and bound with iron hoops.³⁴ The quit claim deeds for the route of the Bishop Brook aqueduct through the rear yards on Genesee Street between Manlius Street and Limestone Creek all specified that the channel would pass at least one foot below the surface to allow for cultivation and other activities.

The new hydraulic canal differed greatly from the wooden aqueduct. It remains an open, flat-bottomed channel laid out in straight courses beginning at a circular reservoir at the high point of the Ledyard Purchase located in the southeast corner near Manlius Street. Its right-of-way extended 24 feet either side of the centerline of channel to allow space required to do maintenance work.³⁵ The street plan of the purchase and the layout of the dyke complemented

²⁷ 88/160; 88/162; 88/164; 88/165. Deeds 97/495, 97/496, and 97/498 were executed in April 1846 following the settlement of Hiram Stilwell's death. He died during the period when Ledyard was carrying out arrangements for the Limestone Creek dyke, now called the Ledyard Dyke or Ledyard Canal.

²⁸ J.W. McVicar. *A Map of the Ledyard purchase by the Fayetteville Hydraulic Company, July 30, 1849*. Manuscript. 1849. (framed and displayed in café of the Fayetteville Free Library) The name Ledyard Purchase identified the land within the boundary as a speculative venture in similar fashion to larger tracts like the Military Tract, the Phelps and Gorham Purchase, and the Poultney Purchase in New York State. Land patents east of the Line of Property established in 1768 were usually also assigned surnames. While often no longer common parlance, these names still identify lands in land documents.

²⁹ Houlihan, 5-6.

³⁰ 88/162.

³¹ Houlihan, 5-6.

³² 90/38; 94/349; 96/6; 96/7; 96/8; 96/9; 96/71; 96/472; 97/499; 97/499; 97/500.

³³ Porter Tremain, *Map of the Village of Fayetteville, New York, with the Adjacent Lands and Water Powers*. n.p., 1849. (framed and displayed in café of the Fayetteville Free Library).

³⁴ Houlihan, 10.

³⁵ This width is specified in all of the deeds whereby Ledyard sold the purchase to the Fayetteville investors and recorded in *Book of Deeds* 99/2-18. It has since been altered, either by willful ignorance or individual deeds with adjoining property holders.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

24

each other, and the original plat is entirely intact. It encompasses a rectilinear street plan divided into blocks that would eventually be subdivided into house lots for those working in the industries that were located on the “water lots,” or mill seats. The dyke, or canal, makes right-angle turns at street corners in the Ledyard Purchase plat. Each of the water lots incorporates approximately 20 feet of fall divided over several steps, or falls. Lots on this canal were labeled LSWL for “Lime Stone Water Lot.” Several more water lots, or mill seats, were arranged on the Bishop Brook channel and were labeled BBWL for “Bishop Brook Water Lot.” The water lots were numbered consecutively on each channel from high to low elevation.³⁶

On the 13th of June 1849, four years after the agreement between Ledyard and the canal investors was signed, Ledyard called in the accrued debt totaling \$33,031.43 from the following: Beach Beard, \$9,138.31; Beach C. Beard, \$2,135.95; John McVicar, \$2,889.59; David Collin, \$6,305.94; Porter Tremain, \$2,713.11; John Sprague et al., \$5,189.46; William Parker, Jr., \$2,906.53; and Hervey Edwards, \$2,762.54.³⁷ Deeds in these amounts were prepared and executed on the first of August for each of them. Porter Tremain prepared a map that labeled all of the blocks and water lots in the Ledyard Purchase. This map was transcribed in the deed book so that the real property transferred *via* each of the eight conveyances was clearly delineated visually as well as described verbally.³⁸

In May 1844, the village of Fayetteville was incorporated. The president John Sprague and four trustees—Porter Tremain, Frederick J. Pratt, Jr., George S. Taylor, and Joseph Fitch—were all industrialists in the village.³⁹ Taylor owned the tannery on Bishop’s Brook Water Lot No. 2. Pratt’s industrial interests—a limekiln, cooperage, and a lumber mill—were located on the east bank of the Limestone Creek feeder north of the turnpike. Tremain was a director of the Fayetteville Hydraulic Canal Company. A little over year later in August 1845, the village established its first fire company—an essential step to protect against damage to the growing number of commercial and industrial interests in Fayetteville.

Hydraulic Village (1850–1898)

By 1850, new hydraulic, or water-powered, mills were planned and opening on the water lots along both the Fayetteville Hydraulic Canal—known more often as the Ledyard Canal or the Ledyard Dyke, or simply, the Dyke—and the six on the Bishop Brook aqueduct. Within a decade of opening, all four lots on the Canal and the six on the Bishop Brook aqueduct were all occupied and producing. French’s *Gazetteer of New York for 1859* called these lots, or mill seats, “valuable water-privileges.”⁴⁰ While steam allowed new industry in places without waterpower or good access to coal to fire boilers, early industrial centers with reliable, high volume waterpower often continued to use it rather than converting. Waterpower did not require construction of boilers, it

³⁶ These details are shown on both the McVicar manuscript map of the Ledyard Purchase and published Tremain map of the village.

³⁷ Houlihan, 6. There is likely to be more detail to be found in the Ledyard family papers Houlihan used to prepare his paper.

³⁸ 99/2–18.

³⁹ Clayton, 370.

⁴⁰ French, 484.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

25

wasn't prone to explosion, and, if already established, it cost little to perpetuate. In such places, steam gradually augmented water over the coming decades, but water remained a viable motive power in established industrial centers in many central New York communities until the final decade of the century. A few examples include Amsterdam and St. Johnsville in Montgomery County and Rockwells Mills in Chenango County.

By the time the survey was taken for Sweet's 1860 *Map of Onondaga County*, the Taylor tannery on Chapel Street opposite John Street occupied Bishop Brook Water Lot No. 1. The Burhans and Blanchard sash and blind factory that probably made many of the window sash and shutters used on the buildings being constructed at the time stood on BBWL No. 4. A foundry was sited on BBWL No. 6 on the east bank of the creek. David Collin opened a sawmill on LSWL No. 1.⁴¹ A pearl barley and a flouring mill stood on LSWL No. 2 between Warren and Washington streets. Beach Beard built his one-story, brick paper mill on Lot 3 at the corner of Cedar and Beach streets in 1852. He hired two brothers, Hiram and Illustrious Remington, versed in papermaking to run it. Reilay's Dyke was labeled Wood and Co.'s Dyke.⁴² A saw mill was located there.

The combination of increased industry and proximity to the Erie Canal boosted the population and number of buildings in Fayetteville. The 1860 federal census was the first to enumerate the village separately from the town, and it recorded 1,281 inhabitants, a 50% increase over the approximate count of 800 provided in Disturnell's 1842 gazetteer. The state census recorded five years earlier shows that while the majority of Fayetteville's population were the descendants of New English outmigrants at the turn of the nineteenth century, employment opportunities had recently drawn as many as 200 Irish Catholic immigrants to Fayetteville. Many had probably left home during the potato famine years of 1846 through 1855, although some may have been earlier immigrants as there had been a steady, if much smaller, stream of Irish immigration to North America before the famine years.

Irish laborers found work and homes throughout industrial areas in New York along the Hudson and Mohawk rivers and the Erie Canal. They rapidly formed neighborhoods in those places and also in larger cities such as Albany, Troy, Utica, and Syracuse. The Roman Catholic church rapidly established parishes in these places. In Fayetteville, Irish Catholics were served by a mission from St. James in Cazenovia rather than having their own church for some time.⁴³ Unsuccessful attempts were made in the 1850s and 1860s to build a local church with a house for a resident priest. In November 1869, a cornerstone was at last laid for a new brick Victorian Gothic church in the upper village on the site of the Eagle Hotel mapped in 1860 facing west between Genesee Street and Salt Springs Road a decade earlier. Mass was celebrated in the new building, which still lacked interior finishes, on Christmas 1870. It was dedicated in November

⁴¹ Rivette, Synopsis: "Precision Castings," 15 July 2005.

⁴² Homer D.L. Sweet, *Map of Onondaga County*, (Philadelphia: A.R.Z. Dawson, 1860). The inset of Fayetteville provides these locations. Rivette, "McIntyre Paper Mill," 22 July 2018, offers date for opening of the paper mill. French, 484, listed 2 large flouring mills, 3 sawmills, 1 pearl barley mill, 1 paper mill, 1 sash blind and door factory, 3 lime and plaster mills, 1 tannery, 1 foundry and machine shop, 1 wheelbarrow factory and 1 cradle factory, 5 carriage factories, and several large establishments for the manufacture of lime, plaster, and waterlime.

⁴³ <https://icfayetteville.org/history/>.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

26

1872 as the Church of the Immaculate Conception, a name still used by the parish today.⁴⁴ By 1874, the parish had opened a sizable cemetery east of the church and facing the south side of Genesee Street.⁴⁵

The 1855 census shows additional trends in Fayetteville's population of the time. There were almost no people of color. A mulatto barber and his family and a black man from the East Indies were recorded. Aside from the sizable influx of Irish, other immigrants were unusual. There were very small numbers of Germans, English, and Welsh. While there was a great variety in occupations, which were probably self-described, ranging from carpenter, boatman, money sharer, tavern keeper, contractor (3 of Reuben Bangs' sons), banker, stone cutter, dressmaker, tailoress, milliner, weaver, merchant, grocer, butcher, shoemaker, teacher, clergyman, machinist, blacksmith, stovemaker, wagonmaker, carriage trimmer, speculator (Beach Beard), farmer, livery [man], and forwarding agent, comparatively few listed themselves working for a single manufacturer. Exceptions might include [grain] cradle maker and paper maker as these items were only made in one mill each. Many called themselves laborers, which probably indicates that Fayetteville manufacturers employed workers on a per day basis rather than for extended periods. The great majority of dwellings recorded were modest wood frame houses valued between \$100 and \$600. The large houses on Genesee Street stand out as they much more highly valued. Brick houses were unusual, and stone examples exceedingly rare.

Infrastructure in sections adjoining the creek and the feeder was affected both by the changes on the canal and fire. In 1851, the Limestone Aqueduct was built to carry the canal over the creek, and the old guard lock that had controlled flow on the feeder at the Fayetteville end was removed. Likewise, the old dry dock built about the same time as the old lock went out of use.⁴⁶ The following year, fire destroyed the south side of Genesee Street in the commercial district. Eleven businesses and four houses were lost. The commercial economy of the lower village remained strong in spite of the losses. The Canal Commission stated a year later, in 1853, that Fayetteville is "the place of deposit for the agricultural products of a large extent of country, and from which very large shipments are made for transportation on all the canals of the state. The number of tons, if we except salt from Syracuse, exceeds that shipped from any other port on the Erie Canal between Rochester and Albany."⁴⁷ The year after that, Beach Beard built a large building that housed Beard's Hotel, several mercantile businesses, and a flourmill to replace the lost property. This was set back from the earlier frontage and created an open square or plaza shown in later maps and partially retained today in Limestone Plaza.⁴⁸ In January of that year, the Bank of Fayetteville, capitalized at \$100,000, was incorporated.⁴⁹ This reorganized as a national bank in 1865.⁵⁰ By this time, the downtown commercial district achieved much of the appearance it retained until the mid-1900s.

⁴⁴ Clayton, 373-4.

⁴⁵ Sweet, Homer D.L. *Sweet's New Atlas of Onondaga County, New York*. (New York: Walker Bros., 1874).

⁴⁶ Williams, 16-17.

⁴⁷ Williams, 8.

⁴⁸ Rivette, Comments provided to author, 4 October 2018.

⁴⁹ French, 90.

⁵⁰ Clayton, 371.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

27

While the mill seats along the aqueduct and canal were soon occupied, the open blocks designed for house lots on the surrounding Ledyard Purchase filled in more slowly. Many of the blocks, which were shown cut in halves and quarters in 1849, remained undivided and undeveloped until after the survey for Sweet's 1860 *Map of Onondaga County* was taken. Other blocks like the west side of Green Street, the block west of Chapel and east of Clinton Square (now Cleveland Park), and the blocks north of Clinton between Walnut and Beach streets were occupied by houses. Beach Beard built worker housing—modest wood frame single-frame dwellings known as tenements in the period—that still stand on Warren and Beach streets. There are additional such houses in the Ledyard Purchase and on Highbridge Street. Most are vernacular interpretations of Greek Revival plans. They generally feature two-story, gable-front facades with symmetrical fenestration, often with a lower, side-gabled wing attached to an eave wall. The best-preserved examples retain plain raking friezes, wood clapboard siding, and six-over-six wood sash in plain casings. With some additional research, many of these could be linked to households recorded in the 1855 state census even though Fayetteville was not separately enumerated from the surrounding town.⁵¹

In 1865, the year the Civil War ended, the old Fayetteville cemetery set aside more than 50 years before, was chartered and enlarged. The property grew from 2.5 acres to about 8. Reuben H. Bangs, Ambrose Clark, David Collin, Jr., Nathan Seward, Porter Tremain, and Hiram Wood—all business leaders in Fayetteville—formed the first board of directors. Among their first actions was the placing of a memorial to the 103 men from Fayetteville lost in the war. The 1874 Sweet's *Atlas of Onondaga County* shows the curvilinear pathways characteristic of the rural cemetery movement inaugurated in the United States before 1840. The site's rolling landscape was planted with 300 trees in 1865.⁵²

Fayetteville continued growing in population and economic success through the 1870s and into the early 1880s. Houses continued to be built on open lots throughout the Ledyard Purchase and the Highbridge Street section on the west bank of the creek. The Episcopalians replaced their wood frame church in 1870 with a limestone Gothic building featured by a corner tower and tall spire (blown off in 1924) at a cost of \$14,000.⁵³ Historian Clayton remarked in 1878 that it was “unusually fine for a village no larger than Fayetteville—an ornament, indeed to the place.” The Presbyterians had replaced their wooden church some time earlier, in 1857, at a cost of \$10,000. A year later than the Episcopalians, the Baptists replace their old wood meetinghouse with a new brick church for the lavish outlay of \$30,000.⁵⁴ With the new Catholic church dedicated in 1872 facing Manlius Street, the upper village now featured four Gothic façades facing Genesee Street and the little triangle formed by the intersection of the several roads.

⁵¹ The village lay in the second election district, and much of it can be identified by a confluence of surnames and a concentration of people, mainly heads of household, who worked in a variety of industrial and commercial endeavors.

⁵² Rivette, Pamphlet: “The Fayetteville Cemetery Association,” July 2016.

⁵³ Wright, 15.

⁵⁴ Clayton, 373.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

28

In 1871, the village reincorporated. Making the triangle of land at the five-corner intersection in the upper village into a park of sorts for an expenditure of less than \$100 was among the trustees' first acts after reincorporation.⁵⁵ At the time, Fayetteville was surrounded by open land on all sides, and the notion of maintaining open land within urban boundaries was just emerging in American cities and villages. When Washington Park was set aside in the original plat of the Ledyard Purchase in the late 1840s, it was a very unusual example in central New York. The minimal appropriation for the triangle's improvement suggests it was still not especially valued, although the 1874 Sweet's atlas marked the triangle as "Park."

In the 14 years elapsed between the 1860 and 1874 map surveys, the number of buildings—especially houses—grew rapidly in Fayetteville. All of the water lots on the canal, aqueduct, and Reilay's Dyke were tenanted. The Bishop Brook aqueduct was shown as a dotted line because it passed underground. Starting at the top, there were Applegate & Noble's bedstead factory on John Street, G.E. Fisher's tannery on Spring Street, the B.C. and H. Beard grist mill on Warren Street, the Burhans & Blanchard sash and blind factory at the northeast corner of Cedar and South Mill streets, and the Beard & Harris foundry between the creek and South Mill. Descending the Ledyard Canal, Collin & Wells saw mill held the uppermost water lot, followed by Hatch & Beard's flour and pearl barley mill adjoining Hatch & Wells on the north half of Water Lot No. 2, and the Beard Crouse & Co. paper mill on Lot No. 3. Three mills—another pearl barley mill, a planing mill, and a sawmill were sited along Reilay's Dyke, the first of these apparently at the confluence of the Ledyard Canal and the older dyke. North of Genesee Street an industrialized section of limekilns owned by Bangs and Gaynor and S. Pratt were associated cooperages. These lined the east bank of the canal feeder. Additional shops, a livery stable, and a "police station" were located on the island formed by the creek and the feeder. E.B. Pratt's brewery stood upstream of all of this development on the west bank of the creek, probably to avoid water contaminated by so much activity downstream.

The census shows that these businesses employed many heads of households as well as many adult male children still residing under their parents' roofs. Correlation of households with owner names on the 1874 atlas would probably show that many of those who labored in this way lived fairly close to their places of employment. It is evident that more people, but not yet a majority, now identified themselves as employed by a specific mill or other business rather than as laborers or day laborers. Women were more likely to be at home than to work, and most who identified occupations, did work such as dressmaking that could be done at home.

Most people, regardless of income or wealth, lived in wood frame houses. Valuations listed in the 1875 census varied greatly, although Genesee Street between the upper and lower commercial areas still formed the most desirable neighborhood in Fayetteville based on consistently high assessment over the entire section of the street. Beyond Genesee Street, however, households recorded adjacent to each other in the census might vary from a few hundred dollars to more than \$2,000. Few neighborhoods featured houses that were all consistently below or

⁵⁵ Rivette, Synopsis: "Fayetteville Parks and Open Spaces," n.d..

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

29

above a median value. Tenancy in houses with lower valuations is not especially predictable: even working class households were more likely than not to own land.

Earlier, immigrants were considerably more likely to be tenants. By 1875, however, very recent immigrants living in Fayetteville appear to have been unusual. There were many Irish and a few English and German-born residents, but many were married to American-born spouses and were raising American children. While a significant portion of the rapid rise in population recorded in the 1840s and 1850s in Fayetteville can be attributed to recent immigrants drawn by employment opportunity in new mills, it appears that natural increase played at least as important a role in the continued growth in population recorded in the 1860s and 1870s. This is further supported by the size of households, where a great majority recorded school-aged children living at home. While households might be smaller than half a century earlier, many people still had two or more offspring.

The census statistics also show that the 1874 atlas depicts the village just before its nineteenth-century population peak in 1880. And, the map nearly coincides with the 1875 census. Taken together, these documents offer a way to learn about residents individually and to see how they fit into the geographical structure of Fayetteville. A very detailed examination and correlation is beyond the scope of this report, but an overview is offered here for potential further amplification. Within the village boundary, the street plan depicted in 1852 and 1860 was unchanged. An area labeled as the Lowe Tract adjoining the south border of the Ledyard Purchase and east of Reilay's Dyke was mapped with new, apparently as yet unnamed, streets lined by narrow house lots. These are now North and South streets. The house of J. Lowe, an English-born miller, occupied a large lot on the east side of Walnut Street. The Lowe Tract was eventually annexed by the village in 1917.⁵⁶

Except for the Lowe Tract adjacent to the village, new construction between 1860 and 1874 mainly filled existing open lots within the street plan that had been established before 1850. New residential construction presented an orderly and rectilinear mien throughout the village of Fayetteville. Based on architectural style, many of the houses built in the period between the 1860 and 1874 maps may have been built earlier rather than later in that period. Many houses—especially modest wood frame single-family worker houses built on streets near the mills on the Ledyard Canal—feature the peaked roofs and proportions established for worker housing in the 1850s rather than the low, deep-eaved roofs and bracketed rooflines popularized by Italianate designs used in the region during the 1870s and 1880s. Church construction was the signal exception: Gothic invariably denoted religious buildings, although it could be used in other settings.

People building large stylish houses in Fayetteville did use Italianate designs, while others altered trim schemes on older gable-roofed houses. There are examples of both patterns on Genesee Street between the upper and lower commercial districts. Several well-to-do business people developed “suburban” properties on large lots at the periphery of the village and on adjacent land. The Avery house, called “Fair View” in the 1874 atlas and now used as the senior

⁵⁶ Rivette, Comments provided by letter, 4 October 2018.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

30

center east of Manlius Street, still stands. S.J. Wells built Wellwood near the circular reservoir of the canal, but this house was torn down in the early 1900s. A few additional examples face Manlius Street. Clinton Street between Warren and Chapel streets features a row of large wood frame Italianate houses on the north side facing the Collin & Wells mill. Individual more modest examples are also located throughout the Ledyard Purchase and Highbridge sections.

Because Italianate designs were easily built using dimensional lumber prepared in steam mills, it prevailed in commercial and industrial buildings. The balloon frame construction technology that developed with dimensional lumber production was easily multiplied over numerous bays or stories and it formed large square spaces offering the possibility for configurations to accommodate machinery or storage. And, the technology could be partially adapted within heavier, traditional mortise-and-tenon construction methods. Examples could be found in both the upper and lower commercial districts in this period. A few small-scale commercial buildings survive near the five-points intersection, but they are mainly stripped of their trim schemes leaving only the characteristic form and massing of the taste.

The density of construction delineated in 1874 illustrates how and where the village had grown in the previous few decades. Lots between the Ledyard Dyke, or Canal, and the Bishops Brook aqueduct tended to be developed. Most houses built south of the Ledyard Canal occupied large lots—half or quarter blocks—rather than more typical narrow frontage village house lots. This indicates a more modest version of the suburban pattern emerging at the eastern edge of Fayetteville. Smaller lot development had occurred, however, north and west of Washington Park adjacent to the Lowe Tract. On the west side of the creek, houses and businesses occupied nearly every lot on Genesee Street west of Highbridge Street. So, too, the blocks south of Genesee Street on Thompson and South Burdick streets and also on North Burdick Street were now largely filled with houses. Small sections with vacant lots were staked and numbered along the west bank of the creek south of Genesee Street. East of the corporation line between Salt Springs Road and Genesee Street, a subdivision of staked and numbered lots labeled “Bangs. Est.” was mapped flanking the newly opened railroad.

The increased use of railroads during the Civil War made them seem a necessary improvement throughout the nation, and both planning and speculating in them were prevailing occupations of the day. Numerous small companies meant to connect communities across central New York were chartered; many failed even before the speculative fervor collapsed in 1873. While we often think of railroads with heavy rails and large-scale locomotives, lines like the Syracuse & Chenango were designed to haul lighter, more valuable, and time sensitive freight and passengers. The Syracuse & Chenango Valley was first incorporated in 1868. The 45.49-mile route connected Syracuse with the village of Earlville in Madison County and opened in February 1873. It was sold in July. The company’s subsequent history of repeated reorganizations, each marked by a name change, is typical. The line eventually became part of the New York Central System in 1891.⁵⁷ It

⁵⁷ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Syracuse,_Chenango_and_New_York_Railroad. This article is brief, but the basic details of this road’s ownership appears to be generally accurate although it misses out that the line was part of the West Shore holdings until 1952. The West Shore, as it was known for its right-of-way on the west bank of the Hudson terminating at Weehawken, New Jersey, became a wholly owned subsidiary of the New York Central System

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

31

appears to have never been part of a through route, but it offered a connection to Syracuse at least into the 1960s, when the New York Central failed. Although the tracks are gone, the right-of-way can be traced through much of the eastern part of the village.

Fayetteville continued thrived as an industrial village connected to the larger waterborne transportation network through the third quarter of the nineteenth century. While in many places, a rail freight connection was viewed as superior to a canal, Fayetteville's largest production—quicklime, waterlime, and cement—was extremely heavy and relied on volume for profitability. In his 1860 gazetteer, French enumerated the scale of this production.⁵⁸ Hamilton Child failed to mention much about Fayetteville in his town of Manlius entry in his *Gazetteer of Onondaga County for 1868–9* except to say that, "In the west part are extensive quarries from which are obtained immense quantities of waterlime, quicklime, and gypsum."⁵⁹ This may also be why the 1875 industrial schedule of the state census omitted all production in Fayetteville except this industry, and oddly, a harness shop that used just 60 hides in its production the previous year. Gristmills of several types, saw mills, furniture factory, and paper mill, all went unrecorded in the industrial schedule even though the population schedule listed those who owned and worked in them.

Some of these mills may have become less profitable during the 1880s. For the first time since its incorporation as a village in 1844, the census recorded a decline in population in 1890, to 1,410 down from a peak of 1,556 in 1880. The first Sanborn fire insurance survey in Fayetteville, taken in 1885, recorded that one business on the aqueduct, the Salg tannery, and the H.L. Beard & Son paper mill on South Mill Street on the Ledyard Canal—were shuttered. Part of the paper mill had burned in 1885, and that section was not replaced. The 1890 Sanborn showed that the gristmill on Warren Street was the only mill still run using power drawn from Bishop Brook. Below that point, the flume was labeled "overflow." The Collin, Arnold, and Sisson Furniture factory had moved from the uppermost water lot on the brook to the Collin lumber mill site located at the top of the Ledyard Canal. The mill was located between Orchard and Canal (now Lincoln) streets, and Chapel and Walnut streets. O.D. Blanchard's sash, door, and blind factory had changed to steam power. The Beard paper mill was under the management of Franklin T. Ray. The 1896 Sanborn series shows virtually no change in the village's built environment. The paper mill, still owned by the Beard estate, had changed management again.

During the last two decades of the century, it appears, based on style, that working class house construction slowed even more than in the 1870s. This makes sense as falling population in the 1880s was probably due mainly to workers seeking better opportunities elsewhere. Even so, the village built a large Romanesque Revival union school at the northwest corner of Genesee and

in 1885 and ran under that name until 1952, when it was formally merged with the New York Central. The 1904 Sanborn shows the "West Shore R.R." running the line. (<http://nyc.railfan.net/westshore.html>). It should be noted that railroad fans are truly fanatical about the intricacies of such transactions.

⁵⁸ French, 484, FN 6. "During the year ending Jan 1, 1859, 1,394 tons of limestone for the manufacture of quicklime, 993 tons of building stone, 10,298 tons of stone plaster, 3,216 tons of ground plaster, 85,459 barrels of waterlime, and 50,410 bushels of quicklime were sold in the village of Fayetteville."

⁵⁹ Hamilton Child, *Gazetteer and Business Directory of Onondaga County, N.Y., for 1868-9*. (Syracuse, New York: Journal Office, 1868): 67.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

32

Manlius streets in 1888.⁶⁰ This was a large, three-story brick building with a hipped roof punctuated by dormers and a symmetrical facade. It contained all grades and an auditorium. It was campaigned for by women who were elected to the school board to replace a small, outdated, and inadequate school building. While women's suffrage in New York was more than a quarter century in the future, women in Fayetteville were already involved politically.⁶¹ Its site was cleared of several commercial buildings and a hotel that were mapped in the 1885 Sanborn map.

As Fayetteville approached the new century, the village bonded itself for a municipal water supply in 1892.⁶² The following year brought nationwide financial panic. That and a fire sealed the fate of the Collin, Arnold, and Sisson furniture factory. In 1898, Charles L. Collin opened the first electrical generation site in Fayetteville on the site.⁶³ One more innovation dating to this period prompted change that would alter the way Fayetteville viewed itself. As industry and population faltered in the village, the Syracuse & Suburban Railroad, an electric trolley line chartered in 1895, reached the village three years later. Its tracks ran along the south side of Genesee Street, crossed Limestone Creek and continued east to Manlius Street. There it turned south and ran along the west side of that highway to Manlius. Fayetteville was poised to become a commuter suburb of Syracuse.

Early Syracuse Commuter Suburb (1898–1944)

From the inauguration of the Erie Canal project in the 1810s, people in Fayetteville capitalized on the navigable feeder and made the village's location an asset even if it was not directly on the main trunk route. In 1903, however, the state appropriated money to develop the proposed barge canal system, which it hoped would revive declining revenues. The 1905 census in Fayetteville listed a single canal boat driver, aged 15, living in the village. While the 1909 Sanborn showed the old Bangs & Gaynor plant as active, the same census recorded a solitary lime burner. Without waterborne freight, the lime industry in Fayetteville had no viable avenue to market, but it may have already been in decline based on the lack of lime-related occupations more than a decade before the old Erie Canal was closed officially in 1917. Most freight activity on the Limestone Creek feeder ceased, but excursion boats continued to run to Kirkville and Canastota until 1923.⁶⁴ By then, the barge canal was fully open (1919) and it bypassed Fayetteville.⁶⁵ By the 1930s, the east bank of the feeder north of Genesee Street soon became an overgrown abandoned industrial area.

In a similar enterprising fashion to early development on the feeder canal, Fayetteville residents engineered and financed waterpower development in the 1830s and 1840s to create an industrial economy. At the same time as the old Erie Canal was superseded by the Barge Canal, waterpower had almost entirely been supplanted by steam and electricity even in places like

⁶⁰ Dates between 1886 and 1888 are offered for this building, but town and village historian Barbara Rivette states that it was built in 1888.

⁶¹ Rivette, Synopsis: "Wellwood School," 7 January 2017.

⁶² Bruce, 795.

⁶³ Rivette, Synopsis: "Precision Castings."

⁶⁴ Rivette, Comments provided to author by letter on 4 October 2018.

⁶⁵ Williams, 21.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

33

Fayetteville where water power had formed a reliable motive power for decades. Steam and electricity could be implemented anywhere, and many industries looked for locations with better transportation offerings and larger markets. Fayetteville faced an uncertain future with neither the Erie Canal nor a demand for waterpower. It was again time to review assets and enhance them.

Although the census recorded a declining population in Fayetteville in 1890 and 1900, it retained a reasonably skilled and established workforce that might attract specific and well-chosen manufacturing interests. In a period when immigration was feared, Fayetteville's work force was almost entirely native born and virtually all white. The Ledyard Purchase section of the village offered comfortable streets lined by generally good housing spanning the socio-economic range. The street plan incorporated mill sites that allowed residents easy access to work. This section was adjacent to a picturesque main thoroughfare featuring handsome houses and several churches adjoining busy commercial districts at either end.

The Highbridge section on the west bank of the creek offered an enclave of varied housing adjoining Genesee Street, where there were more small stores and shops. The jail was located on the island between the creek and the feeder, which may indicate that this area was rough in comparison to the neighborhoods east of the creek. Unlike most of the village, this section was almost entirely redeveloped after World War II, leaving only photographs, maps, and potential archaeology as evidence of its appearance at the turn of the twentieth century.

Additional attractions included the new school and services such as water and electricity, both increasingly viewed as necessities for health and convenience. Fayetteville lay on an established east-west highway that was adopted by the state (now NY 5) before 1920. While the canal connection was lost by that time, there were both railroad and trolley (soon after replaced by a motorbus) options. Good access to Syracuse proved to be of paramount importance for workers and some goods. These many conveniences were in a setting largely free of the grime of steam-powered manufacturing and transportation, and there was even space to grow east of Manlius Street and north of Elm Street should additional housing be desired. The 1900 census recorded the twentieth-century population nadir of 1,304 residents. By 1910, the village rebounded to 1,410, and it rose again, to 1,584, in 1920. In 1930, it had expanded nearly 30% to 2,008. The rise in 1940 was more modest, to 2,172.

The 1905 census and the 1904 Sanborn fire insurance map offer an opportunity similar to the 1874 Sweet atlas and the 1875 census to correlate records for an understanding of village development in the period. By 1904, fewer industries were mapped than in 1874. In 1904, the Stickley brothers, Leopold and J.G., opened a new furniture factory on the south half of Limestone Water Lot No. 1, the site developed earlier as the Collin, Arnold & Sisson furniture makers and before that part of the Collin saw mill. The 1904 map shows a very stripped down site with lumber sheds and "scattered lumber." A building on the south line housed the painting and varnishing department with storage above. This was attached by an enclosed walkway on the second story to a sawing and planing building that paralleled the Ledyard Canal at the southeast corner of the block. Farther north, a separate building housed a drying kiln. By 1909, the plant was in full swing with a new upholstery building adjoining the north eave wall of the finishing building. These formed the distinctive double gable profile still evident today. A packing room

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

34

with a cabinet manufacturing room above was set between this and the sawing and planing building. These early buildings retain their wood shingled exteriors with regular fenestration featuring six-over-six wood sash. The factory had its own 25,000-gallon water tank elevated 50 feet to improve pressure. The 1905 census listed Leopold living on Manlius Street, and there were numerous workers living in the neighborhood around the factory. In the coming years, Stickley would develop a niche manufacturing sturdy, aesthetically pleasing Craftsman-style oak furniture and later also “early American” maple furniture designed for both elegant and humble settings and also for domestic and institutional ones. The building, with later additions, has been turned into the Fayetteville Free Library, which opened in 1906 in the house once owned by Robert Crouse on Genesee Street.⁶⁶

Excepting the Collin electrical plant, the paper mill was the only other Ledyard Canal mill still in operation. In 1905, it was labeled D.B. Lawless and used a combination of steam and water power. Several papermakers were recorded in the census. In 1911, Winfield and Lowell McIntyre of Watertown bought the plant. By 1920, they only manufactured anti-tarnish, chemically neutral, papers for wrapping all variety of metal items. Like Stickley, McIntyre found a niche, which they exploited until 2002, when they closed. They were the last mill to use the water supplied by the Ledyard Canal.⁶⁷

On the opposite side of South Mill Street, the water-powered H.N. Burhans planing mill (a different plant from the earlier Burhans & Blanchard sash and blind factory) was mapped adjacent to the old Reilay Dyke. Burhans himself was recorded in the census, but it appears there were few if any additional regular employees. The site of the former sash and blind factory was now occupied by the steam-powered foundry and machine shop of G.D. Grannis. A few foundrymen and machinists and a pattern maker were recorded living in the village. W.M. Jones gristmill on Warren Street was only other Bishop Brook water lot still hosting a manufacturing operation. It was still water-powered in 1909, but a decade later, it used a gasoline engine. Harry Tuttle carried on the business at least through 1929, but in the final Sanborn map surveyed in 1943, the mill had ceased operations, and the site was cleared except for the dwelling house on the south line that still stands.

A glove factory with several workers listed in the census was located in the Highbridge section of the village and given a special inset on the Sanborn because its neighborhood was not otherwise surveyed. The Fayetteville Creamery on a siding of the West Shore R.R. (part of the New York Central System) was shown adjacent to a coal shed, which probably provided the steam for processing milk. The census listed a single coal dealer, who surely received his supply by rail.

People in Fayetteville worked at many occupations, and as a group created a place with a diverse economy and a work force almost entirely employed. It exhibited a broad age range. A wagon repairer and a carriage painter who worked on the island were surely facing obsolescence. Two electricians, a plumber, and an ice dealer looked to the future when everyone’s house would require their services. A few farmers lived at the periphery, both in the Highbridge area and on

⁶⁶ *Historical Sketch of Fayetteville*. Typescript (undated). [ca.1968-99]: 9.

⁶⁷ Rivette, “McIntyre Paper Mill.” Their advertisement on page 8 in the 1921 *Souvenir* celebrating the paving of Genesee Street listed white and manila tissues, anti-tarnish Kraft [paper], and lightweight wrappings.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

35

the northeast side of the village. Of the more unusual occupations listed, there were an English-born golf instructor and the two daughters of the local dentist who were art embroiderers. Few women worked outside the home, but a number were employed in the upholstery department at Stickley and at least one took in laundry.

The last of Fayetteville's sizable twentieth-century industries was located on the north half of Limestone Water Lot No. 1, where the Collin lumber mill had stored logs and later developed the electrical plant. The site was acquired *circa* 1908 by the E.B. Van Wagner Manufacturing Company. Its plant composed of a sizable concrete block building facing Orchard Street and vacant buildings "to be removed" was delineated in the 1909 Sanborn map.⁶⁸ The site featured a flume drawn off the canal and also an office and a wagon shed. The company produced "finished castings," an important component in the continuing development of American manufacturing, which depended upon reliably interchangeable parts. The 1919 Sanborn labeled the factory Precision Casting following a merger with that Syracuse-based company in 1915.

The new company was capitalized at \$315,000, and worked with alloys of aluminum, lead, tin, and zinc. Precision made detonator caps grenades used by the British and American armies during World War I. Precision went through several mergers and acquisitions including one with Atlas Die Castings Company of Worcester, Massachusetts, in 1926. The site on Orchard Street remained in continuous use until 1952, when Precision built a new, still-standing, plant adjoining the east side of the railroad tracks on the north side of Genesee Street.⁶⁹ The new site offered space for expansion, and it seems that people still believed in the utility of a rail connection.

As a group, McIntyre Paper, Stickley Furniture, and Precision Casting formed the industrial base in Fayetteville for the next half-century. It appears that much of the labor force lived in houses built mainly in the period 1850 through 1900 on the streets laid out in the Ledyard Purchase. These people perpetuated the pattern of workers living within walking distance to most daily activities such as work, school, and shopping established more than half a century earlier in Fayetteville. It appears that existing housing stock satisfied the demand for quite some time, as very little new housing was constructed in Fayetteville until the 1920s. Further, demolition of older housing stock was unusual. Within the Ledyard Purchase, bungalows and a few American Four-Square houses were built on lots that were previously open. Additional examples were built on Salt Springs Road and also Highbridge and North Mill streets. Some of the bungalows are unusually large and handsome examples; Four Squares were by definition modest houses.

Brooklea Heights, a new subdivision using a traditional plan of deep lots with narrow frontages, was platted by the early 1920s facing Brooklea Drive, the new name for North Mill Street. This change indicates a cultural shift from manufacturing to suburban development. Middle-class bungalows and Four-Squares line both sides of the street at the south end and share characteristics that suggest a single builder. The two-story "colonials" on the north side of the street at the north end of Brooklea Drive may also have been built on spec.

⁶⁸ Rivette, Synopsis: "Precision Casting/Syracuse Plastics."

⁶⁹ Rivette, Synopsis: "Precision Casting/Syracuse Plastics."

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

36

Two further residential subdivisions—Collincroft and Huntleigh Park—were platted during the 1920s in and adjacent to Fayetteville. Neither was designed as a working class neighborhood near mills. Instead, both featured characteristics of middle class suburban development around urban areas where people commuted to a city, usually by rail. The lots are generally larger and more varied in configuration from the 50 x 150 house lots staked in so many villages in the region after the mid-1800s. Trees were established early, or retained, to provide leafy enclaves, an ambience both retain. Their names suggest bucolic settings.

Collincroft, also called Collinwood, was designed in 1923 by a Syracuse University forestry professor, who adopted a curvilinear plan that conforms to the rolling terrain of the generally triangular parcel encompassed by North Manlius, North Mill, and Elm streets.⁷⁰ Center Street cuts off the southwestern corner. The street plan offers many points of access. Collin Avenue connected the intersection of North Mill and Center streets with North Manlius Street. Linden Lane began at Center Street and flowed into Collin Avenue. And Oak Street, later renamed Lafayette, crossed the subdivision from Linden Avenue to North Manlius. These streets wrap the small triangular park still at the center of Collincroft. All streets retain sidewalks. Some houses on Linden feature designs influenced by the Arts and Crafts movement with an admixture of the Colonial Revival. By 1929, approximately a dozen houses—none of them large—had been built.

Huntleigh Park was platted east of the railroad between Genesee Street and Salt Springs Road.⁷¹ It adjoins the site of never-used subdivision platted, apparently in anticipation of the railroad, on the Reuben Bangs Estate that was mapped in 1874. Huntleigh Park features a street plan similar to Collincroft although the land is essentially level. Redfield Avenue, named for the man credited with the concept for the Ledyard Canal, curves into Oakwood Street, which meets Huntleigh Avenue in a T-junction. The latter connects to both main highways. Ledyard Avenue connects Salt Springs Road and Oakwood Avenue within the subdivision. All streets have sidewalks, and the plan makes it easy to enter and leave the enclave at several points. In 1929, the Sanborn map shows there were houses on Redfield Avenue and at the corner of Ledyard Avenue and Salt Springs Road. The very earliest houses feature bungalow and cottage plans, but the great majority are colonial revival examples. Based on designs, contractors bought intermittent lots and built houses using similar or identical plans. This creates syncopated, but coherent, streetscapes with virtually no infill and limited alteration.

The park-like aspect of the between-the-wars subdivisions exemplifies the increasing interest in municipal green space—both private and public—encouraged by the City Beautiful movement. Many date this movement, which advocated wide, planned streets with green space and handsome buildings to the World's Columbian Exposition held in Chicago in 1893. The "White City" built for the fair offered a model to some of the millions of people who visited and became proponents of the emerging field of city planning. Among these was Charles Mulford Robinson (1869-1917) who wrote extensively over the following decades about beautification efforts large and small and

⁷⁰ Robert Hesslein, "Fayetteville and the Paradox of Suburbia." Paper prepared for Study of the City course taught by J. Alexander Garvin (no institution noted). (Typescript. 22 January 1974): 21-22.

⁷¹ A firm date for Huntleigh Park has proved elusive. No official plat map appears to have been filed in the village. It was not delineated in 1919 by Sanborn, but it was surveyed and showed a few lots with houses in 1929.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

37

became the first professor of civic design at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign in 1913.⁷² In 1909, Emma Beard of Fayetteville retained Robinson to review the village and prepare a report to aid in planning for its future.⁷³

Robinson correctly foresaw that Fayetteville's future lay in making it attractive as a suburb rather than as a city. He said Fayetteville should be a "home section" rather than a commercial or manufacturing section. He urged that the village make accessible to the public "the natural beauty of hill and dale, of water course and vegetation, with which nature has so lavishly endowed it" so "that there may be drawn to it that population which has the culture, and the means, to appreciate and choose what is lovely."⁷⁴

Robinson's review offers, if closely read, a visual description of sections of Fayetteville at the time. Some can be correlated the *Souvenir* published in 1921 in celebration of paving Genesee Street. This was, coincidentally, also the fiftieth anniversary of the village's reincorporation. Robinson approached the village from the west on Genesee Street as if riding the Syracuse & Suburban trolley from the city. He described Genesee Street west of the creek as "a shaded residential street that has flowed so easily and naturally out of open country that one can scarcely guess where town begins and country ends." This shows to modern readers the extent to which postwar sprawl has completely altered this section from a century ago. Robinson decried the present appearance of the island between the bridges, remarking that it "is marred on the street's north side by neglect and on its south by a clutter of poor buildings and a dump. Only a town or city does that sort of thing." He castigated the proposed trolley freight house for the open land beyond the north street frontage because he believed the island could instead offer a pleasing gateway. He offered landscaping ideas to improve its appearance, making it a pleasant park, possibly with a "reading room," or library.⁷⁵

Robinson wasn't any more complimentary about the appearance of the lower commercial district east of Limestone Creek. He described the buildings as "as uninteresting and uninviting as possible. Fortunately, however, nearly every building is old, so that the lack of taste exemplified is not necessarily, or probably, a measure of modern ideals, while growth and prosperity in Fayetteville is bound to mean rebuilding." The buildings on the south side of the plaza are now all gone, replaced by the bridge built in the early 1950s to straighten Genesee Street.

Continuing on Genesee towards the five-point intersection at Manlius Street, Robinson praised the lack of fences, the good sidewalks, and the handsome trees, although he thought there were too many the last. He urged retaining an "expert tree man" to prune and remove some as had been done in some New England villages. He strongly disliked the "duplication and triplication of poles" and wires overhead.⁷⁶ He described the high school built in 1888 on

⁷² <https://tclf.org/pioneer/charles-mulford-robinson>.

⁷³ *Sketch*, 5.

⁷⁴ Charles Mulford Robinson, *Fayetteville Opportunities*. (Rochester, New York: n.p., 1909): [1].

⁷⁵ Robinson, [2]. In 2013, the village opened Canal Landing Park in this section, but it doesn't really match Robinson's vision as it is tucked behind buildings, bridges, and strip development rather than forming a visual gateway.

⁷⁶ Robinson, [3].

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

38

Genesee Street as “bare as a fort and as forbidding as a jail” and called for landscaping to soften its appearance.

From the school, he moved to the adjoining yard, where he called for a playground. Here he began his vision for “one of the most complete and well-rounded park systems of any community in the United States.” This system would encompass community-wide parks (the triangle and playground he recommended) on Genesee Street, neighborhood parks on Washington and Chapel streets (the latter located where the semi-circular basin of the Ledyard Canal was located adjacent to the topmost water lot), and new parks. The last he described in the last pages of his report. He urged a walking park using the right-of-way flanking the Ledyard Canal stretching from a park surrounding the circular reservoir in the southeast corner of the village to the creek. Robinson believed that the five stone arch bridges over the canal were the “most beautiful things in Fayetteville.” He recommended that the Reilay Dyke be incorporated into the system, saying, “the route of the abandoned power canal offers a site for a lovely drive, beneath the bluff, under overhanging trees, with outlooks over the wide meadow.” He also recommended athletic fields be laid out between the creek and North Mill Street.⁷⁷ Over the years since, several of Robinson’s recommendations have been adopted. In 1923, Harry M. Tuttle donated three acres behind his house on Brooklea Drive for a playground. In 1937, after the old school was demolished, there was a playground for a short time. This was on the site of the present firehouse.⁷⁸ When in 1941, the school board proposed selling the large lot where the canal reservoir is located, the proposal was turned down. Huntington Beard Crouse bought it and donated it to the village as a park (now called Beard Park).⁷⁹ The village accepted the gift and a fund to maintain the park, which designed by N.A. Rotunno of Syracuse University School of Architecture, in perpetuity.⁸⁰

The new Wellwood School was built on the site of the Wellwood estate and opened in 1932. Stickley furnished the large Georgian Revival brick building. It remains in service as a middle school. When the school moved to the present Wellwood site, this left a sizable parcel open at the five-point intersection. In 1938, the village constructed the two-story, five-bay, Georgian Revival municipal building on the site. The father-daughter architect team of Gordon and Marjorie Wright designed it. This provided a permanent and purpose-built location for meetings, court, and the variety of services required by the village. Over time, lower wings in similar style have been added to each gable wall, and in 2011, a new firehouse was added to the east end. It features garage bays facing both Genesee and Manlius streets.

When Robinson prepared his report on Fayetteville in 1909, automobiles were still unusual. The drives he advocated along the creek were surely carriage drives. During the 1910s, car ownership increased rapidly, and by 1920, the Syracuse & Suburban trolley line was in financial straits. On the first of January 1921, it suspended operations between Syracuse and Manlius. Motorbus service was introduced the same day, and the Chenango branch of the New

⁷⁷ Robinson, [5-7].

⁷⁸ Rivette, Synopsis: “Parks.”

⁷⁹ Rivette, Synopsis: “Wellwood School”

⁸⁰ Rivette, Synopsis: “Parks.”

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

39

York Central added service to fill the breach.⁸¹ The latter accommodations suggest that some still relied on public transportation. The 1919 Sanborn showed recently added automobile services, but it was the 1929 map that depicted more change related to cars. These include the large service garage on Genesee east of Manlius Street, which forms the rear portion of the now abandoned car dealership; a filling station near the corner of these two main routes; and also two auto showrooms in the 400 block of Genesee Street. When the 1943 Sanborn was surveyed, it noted numerous automobile garages adjoining houses throughout the village. Many houses in Huntleigh Park, now developed to capacity, featured attached garages. The Baptist church, abandoned when that congregation merged with the Presbyterians, was now the site of a gas station.

The increasing number of automobiles encouraged new subdivision at the periphery of the village. In 1930, 2,008 people were counted living in Fayetteville. This exceeded the nineteenth century peak by nearly 500 people. The Springside subdivision in the southwest section of the village west of Highbridge Street was platted in 1936. Even with rising population, this seems an unusually optimistic plan during the national economic depression of the period, and based on tax department maps, it appears that lots were only very gradually purchased and individual houses built on them. The plat for the Wellwood Manor subdivision opposite the new school was filed in 1940. Here, too, lot development was slow. It is easy to pick out the colonial houses on the lots closest to Manlius Street as those developed soon after Wellwood Manor opened.

Even with early residential subdivision, in 1945, Fayetteville retained the corporation boundary established in 1871. This comprised the upper and lower commercial areas of the early 1800s connected by the row of handsome dwellings built on Genesee Street during the 1820s and 1830s; the Ledyard Purchase section developed mainly during the 1850s, 1860s, and 1870s; and the Highbridge Street area west of Limestone Creek. The boundary also took in the large triangle of partially open land between North Mill and North Manlius that was subdivided for the Collincroft development in the early 1920s. The village retained its rural setting despite proximity to Syracuse, and the demarcation between village and rural land was clear on most sides. The line was gently blurred east of the five-point intersection on Genesee Street and Salt Springs Road. In other areas, the break was clear. Fayetteville was recognizably a historic industrial and commercial village set within open, mainly agricultural land. At the same time, its established residential streets offered a leafy suburban alternative to urban neighborhoods in the city of Syracuse. Since the early decades of the twentieth century, the village had sought to enhance the emerging suburban identity while preserving the earlier one.

Postwar Suburb (1945–70)

In the postwar era, rural historically commercial and industrial villages in the Syracuse area quickly became residential suburbs of the larger city. Syracuse was home to several nationally prominent corporations that offered many new white collar jobs as the United States began turning its wartime production technology to peacetime wants and needs. New employees, many educated under the provisions of the GI Bill, hoped to move to newly developed suburbs with

⁸¹ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Syracuse_and_Suburban_Railroad. The information offered is quoted from *New York Times*, 2 January 1921.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

40

modern schools, crisply built new houses, and open space to raise families. A booklet titled “Fayetteville has Plans for your Future” published in 1948 presented a bird’s-eye street plan of the village showed the historic core and the 1920s subdivisions and picked out churches, factories, the school, the cemeteries, and the railroad with streets dotted by trees, but without houses.⁸² It shows the village just a moment before residential subdivisions that would nearly quadruple its land area began. Perhaps houses would have made the map too cluttered, but the lack of houses suggests there was plenty of space. In reality, most of the house lots encompassed by the map were already occupied. Accommodating new residents required more land and more houses.

Still, Fayetteville was likely better positioned geographically and culturally than some other similar places for this suburban shift because it had already encouraged such expansion. Its trustees had been planning for suburbanization since the early 1900s. The 1948 booklet related that there planning and zoning boards appointed in the village. The village’s identity as a residential suburb now exploded on a scale previously unimagined. From 1940 to 1970, its population more than doubled from 2,172 to 4,996. In the postwar period, the village annexed land east and west of its historic core that nearly quadrupled its area. All of these new sections were platted for residential subdivision as the village sprawled onto recently cultivated land now more valuable as house lots than as farmland.

Subdivisions opened and annexed in Fayetteville in the period 1945 through 1970 illustrate how such developments had evolved by the mid-1940s and how they continued to change over the ensuing quarter century.⁸³ The earliest postwar developments were located west of the creek north and south of Genesee Street. They had much in common with house lots that had been platted in villages and cities of the region for at least a century. The lots were generally uniform in acreage and rectilinear. Streets were comparatively wide for residential streets, but these new neighborhoods accommodated automobiles rather than horse-drawn vehicles. Auto travel was so widely adopted that sidewalks were done away with. People drove to errands and to visit. Only children rode bikes or walked. Because people—even if they still commuted on the bus that had replaced the old Syracuse & Suburban trolley or on the Chenango Branch train—expected to have garages, lots were wider to accommodate a driveway that would not take up all of the yard space. Access to new residential subdivisions also changed during this period. Earlier plats included several access points from the existing highway plan; later ones were often planned as *cul-de-sacs* instead.

Houses, whether built on spec using similar or identical plans or by individual owners, were generally modest. One-story and story-and-a-half designs were the norm. While the prewar “Capes” with symmetrical plans and simple “colonial” details and “cottage” designs with steeply pitched roofs and varied fenestration were still built, most new construction displayed characteristics drawn from Mid-Century Modern ideas. The one-story, low-profile, side-gabled house with deep eaves and slightly asymmetrical and syncopated fenestration was the simplest

⁸² *Fayetteville has plans for your future*. [Fayetteville, New York]: 1948: [15–16].

⁸³ The following discussion of locations, dates, and descriptions relies on plat maps filed in the village offices and field review. For more detailed discussion of individual subdivisions, please refer to the separate discussion of them.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

41

version of the new design paradigm. In the 1940s and early 1950s, wooden exterior finishes were typical, but both asbestos shingles and aluminum siding were quickly adopted. Such houses used other postwar materials, especially laminated trusses and sheathing composed of a variety of materials. Windows often featured horizontally oriented configurations. Individually designed houses might feature more traditional and more varied exterior finishes such as brick and stone veneer. Large multi-flue chimneys could accommodate a hearth and a furnace. An architect might use more glass and more dramatic rooflines with broader eaves. Some Fayetteville subdivisions feature extensive alteration while others are very representative of their early appearance. Throughout this period, however, most residential subdivision in Fayetteville appears to have attracted buyers from middle and upper management with a head of household who commuted to work in one of the many Syracuse corporations.

Early subdivisions were very modest. The plat map for a development known as both the Griffin Farm Tract and the Burdick Street Lots located on the flats adjoining the creek east of North Burdick Street was filed in 1949. Its single street, Warner Avenue, forms a horseshoe meeting North Burdick Street at either end. It was soon extended northward when Kennedy Street was opened. The very modest one-story, side-gabled wood frame houses built on slabs and occupying small, shallow lots were identical to begin with. A similar row of houses spans the distance between the north and south legs of Warner Street on the east side of North Burdick. These may have been built using plans and materials prepared by Celotex, as the local lumberyard, B.H. Tracy, was a dealer. Many of these houses now feature later exterior finishes and replaced window sash, but the development is generally in good condition and surprisingly intact.

The plat for Coakley Manor was filed about the same time. This is a sizable development adjacent to the west side of Springside and also Highbridge Street. Mott Road forms the west boundary. The land rises gradually westward away from the creek forming an undulating landscape that offers a varied landscape further enhanced by a gently curving street plan between the two poker straight historic routes of Mott Road and Highbridge streets. Houses here are also modest, but feature slightly larger lots and now also a great variety of remodeling and expansion. This suggests that buyers in Coakley Manor were somewhat more affluent than those off North Burdick Street. The Highbridge Tract subdivision filed in 1951 bridged the space between Coakley Manor and Highbridge Street.

After the alignment of Genesee Street over Limestone Creek was straightened in the early 1950s and a new four-lane bridge carried the highway over what remained of the commercial district adjacent to Limestone Creek, subdivision began in earnest east of North Manlius Street. Three years earlier, in 1952, Precision Casting moved from its site in the Ledyard Purchase to a large new facility alongside the railroad right-of-way facing Genesee Street. Both events probably influenced new subdivision in this part of the village. Glenside, a *cul-de-sac* development of a single street—Cashin Lane—was platted in 1956. The following year, the largest residential subdivision to date in Fayetteville, Brookside, was annexed by the village. Aladdin Drive crossed Bishop Brook and linked Brookside, which had a single access from Genesee Street on Shady Lane, with Glenside. Brookside was so large that it required its own sewage treatment plant, which Dominic Timpano, the developer, sited off Aladdin Drive. After the village expanded its capacity in 1972,

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

42

this became Coulter Park.⁸⁴ Maplewood on the south side of Genesee Street opposite Glenside was opened in the same period as was the eastward expansion of Huntleigh Park on Oakwood and Fairfield streets, Bishop Drive, and Edgemere Lane. The break in development in the last is easily observed by a shift from earlier more traditional designs and Mid-Century ones. And, the expansion has no sidewalks.

In the early 1960s, three smaller residential subdivisions were opened. Both Bishop's Bluff (1961) and Gleasonwood (1963) are accessed from North Manlius Street. Bishop's Bluff features houses with colonnaded fronts in some sections that were clearly built on spec and others with late Mid-Century Modern designs that appear to have been individually built. Houses in the small *cul-de-sac* development of Gleasonwood all used the identical plan. The latter design is composed of a low-profile, two-story side-gabled main block and a lower wing on one gable wall that encloses a garage. The roof of the wing is carried across the main block front façade as a pent roof under which the main entrance is recessed.

This basic design is replicated throughout subdivisions developed in the 1960s and 1970s in Fayetteville. Not only was it used in subdivisions: it is the most common design used for infill housing in the Ledyard Purchase section of the village where, as industries withdrew, lots opened up. Examples are found south of Franklin Street where Stickley had storage areas, and also in a few small pockets south of Clinton Street.

During the 1960s, two churches vacated their sites on Genesee Street and moved to new locations on expansive properties offering space for parking and a variety of activities. In 1960, the Methodists acquired a large parcel between Precision Casting and Glenside, from which it can be accessed. The congregation built a large new Mid-Century Modern church influenced by "colonial" design. Its square tower capped by a slender spire, the one-story classroom building, and a fellowship hall are all later additions. The entire building is set well back from the highway on a flat lot with lawns and a very large parking lot. In 1961, the brick Immaculate Conception church opened in the early 1870s, suffered a fire. Mass continued to be celebrated there until the new Mid-Century Modern church was completed on a 54-acre parcel on the south side of Salt Springs Road. It was dedicated in 1969. The parcel had been acquired more than a decade before as the site for an elementary parochial school opened in 1958. A convent was built in 1964 to support the school.⁸⁵ By this time, Sheffield Lane, a later addition to the Wellwood Manor subdivision, accessed the property from the southwest.

Changes to Genesee Street where it crossed Limestone Creek in the early 1950s greatly altered the commercial district on both banks. East of Limestone Creek, the highway was straightened and the bridge replaced with a span elevated nearly two stories above the grade of the commercial district. Surviving historic-period buildings on the south side of the street were demolished to allow space for the supports carrying the new bridge. South Mill Street now ends at that abutment with a flight of steps to the new highway grade. A cutoff passes under the bridge access to join the earlier turnpike alignment, which crosses on a two-lane span connecting

⁸⁴ Rivette, Synopsis: "Parks."

⁸⁵ <https://icfayetteville.org/history/>.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

43

Limestone Plaza with the strip development on the west side of the creek. There, Genesee Street was widened to four lanes, and this area—described in 1909 by Robinson as a seamless transition from surrounding farmland to the lower village—quickly transformed into an auto-oriented commercial strip with new one-story commercial buildings and a car dealership. Limestone Plaza preserves a handful of historic period brick commercial buildings on the north and east sides (North Mill Street, now Brooklea Drive), but the sense of this once busy commercial district containing a “diversification of stores...within easy walking distance of any part of the village,” “where practically all of the everyday needs may be purchased” was lost.⁸⁶ A survey conducted by the Fayetteville Rehabilitation Commission in 1972 found that fewer than 50% of residents made regular purchases in Fayetteville.⁸⁷

The realignment of Genesee Street influenced changes farther east on Genesee Street in the commercial district at the five-point intersection. The north side of the street east of Manlius Street was redeveloped in the 1950s and 1960s with a few commercial outlets and a small pedestrian mall. While a large Italianate mansion was knocked down at the northeast corner, a row of large late Victorian and early colonial revival houses east of the little mall is partially intact. Two supermarkets, both long since reused, were opened on the south side of Genesee Street west of Manlius Street. The open spaces left by churches moving and consolidating in the period offered space for new building. The site of the Roman Catholic church east of the triangle is now occupied by a large bank of mixed architectural styles and finishes. On the south side of Genesee, another church site hosts a large office building. By and large, the remaining historic period buildings were stripped of their historic finishes. A few buildings—the early tavern on the north side (until recently, Hullar’s), the adjacent building on the east, and two two-story, three-bay commercial buildings between Spring and Chapel streets—remain.

By the early 1970s, previously open land on Highbridge Street, which can be accessed by a lighted intersection west of the creek, also developed as a residential and office space district with townhouse development and two-story office buildings designed to fit into the residential streetscape.

While new and repurposed development swirled around them, the historic core of the village—the residential district between the old upper and lower business districts, the Ledyard Purchase section, and the residential area of Elm, Center, and Mechanic streets north of Genesee and east of Brooklea Drive—remained largely as it was. Two small-scale factories—L. and J.G. Stickley and McIntyre Paper—remained in business along the Ledyard Canal until 1985 and 2002 respectively. Precision’s buildings north and south of the canal hosted a number of tenants, even after a fire destroyed the south section in 1962. The first and only sizable apartment complex in Fayetteville was built soon after. As industry moved out of the Ledyard Purchase section, spaces where various earlier industrial buildings and yards stood (see 1943 Sanborn for these) were filled with houses. Replacement, even of very modest historic houses, was and remains unusual.

⁸⁶ *Fayetteville has plans for your future*. [Fayetteville, New York]: 1948.

⁸⁷ Hesslein, 4.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

44

Post-1970

Fayetteville's population peaked in 1970 at 4,996. Already the pace of new residential construction had slowed. New building differed from earlier patterns. In 1969, the Orchard was the first condominium development opened in the village. Each of its one-story buildings, all sited on a landscaped parcel, encompass up to four units. Similar later developments opened on the Amos Tract annexed by the village in 1967 east of Brookside and Maplewood at Signal Hill north of the highway and Briar Brook south of the highway. These illustrate the evolving aesthetics of architectural and landscape development of this pattern of house construction. It also appears that the price point has increased over time from houses designed for middle management to more well-to-do and possibly also retired middle and upper management in the most recent developments. Between 1969 and 1974, 225 units of apartments and condominiums built, and by the latter date, 10% of village population lived in such units.⁸⁸

The shift of industry away from Syracuse—part of the “Rust Belt” so hard hit in the 1970s and 1980s by varied economic factors—surely played a significant role in slumping population after 1970. But, Fayetteville was long since established as a suburb inhabited largely by management. While the floor jobs were moved south and, beginning in the 1990s, moved offshore, many companies retained much of their management in the region. Fayetteville's own industries were comparatively small and occupied established niches. It is unclear how much of an impact the closing of the last industries in Fayetteville affected its economy. An aging population with smaller households may have played nearly as significant role in diminishing population in the village. This pattern has stabilized development from the rapid growth of the 1950s and 1960s and allowed the village to consider how it wishes to proceed in planning for the future.

⁸⁸ Hesslein, 32.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

45

ASSESSMENT OF HISTORIC INTEGRITY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Village of Fayetteville in the Town of Manlius, Onondaga County, New York, embodies layered and adjacent patterns of historic planning and architectural development that represent nearly all periods from the early 1790s through 1948. These neighborhoods form a historic core composed of nearly 800 properties set within areas annexed for residential subdivision in the postwar period. The neighborhoods range outwards in all directions from the small (42 properties) Genesee Street Hill-Limestone Plaza National Register Historic District (NRHD) centered on the row of high style houses on generous lots facing Genesee Street between the two historic commercial districts. Six buildings in the lower commercial district are also listed in the district. One more building, the Levi Snell house, is individually listed in the Register.

This survey identifies additional historic architectural resources, mostly located within neighborhoods surrounding the existing historic district on all sides. In the aggregate, these neighborhoods form a historic core illustrating how and why the Village of Fayetteville developed in the period from the 1790s through 1948. Most of the historic neighborhoods listed below appear eligible for listing in the National Register under Criterion A because they broaden our knowledge and understanding of how the community of Fayetteville developed and changed over the period from its early settlement through World War II. These sections preserve plats and buildings that illustrate in the aggregate how Fayetteville grew from a turnpike hamlet to a canal village to an industrial village based on its engineered waterpower canals drawn off both Limestone Creek and Bishop Brook. The Ledyard Purchase area may also be eligible under Criterion A for its representation of the broader patterns of early American industry and commerce and associated community development. Many resources in the proposed expansion and Huntleigh Park districts are also eligible under Criterion C because they “embody distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of construction.” A few buildings were designed by locally significant architects. The Ledyard Canal or Dyke around which the Purchase was planned appears eligible for documentation in the Historic American Engineering Record (HAER).

The historic neighborhoods listed below almost all lie within the village boundary delineated in *Sweet’s Atlas of Onondaga County* published in 1874. A map drawn by the Onondaga County GIS and provided in Appendix 1 illustrates the locations of these neighborhoods and recommends further listing of some of them in the National Register of Historic Places. Representative overview photography in Appendix 2 illustrates these neighborhoods. The neighborhoods are briefly described below in generally chronological order:

- **North of Genesee St:** This section appears to have extended east from the limekilns and canal side (Limestone Creek feeder) on Elm, Mechanic, and Center streets before 1850. The west end features modest and early worker housing. East of Center Street houses are larger and more stylish. Some of these were remodeled in the early twentieth century. The municipal building constructed in 1938 and the triangular park associated with the early five-point intersection around which the first commercial

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

46

district developed offer an island of historic period development adjacent to Elm and North Manlius streets.

Recommendation: The present Genesee Street Hill-Limestone Plaza NRHD should be expanded to include this section of the village.

- **Highbridge Street area:** A second, less intact, early neighborhood adjoins the west bank of the creek south of Genesee Street. This encompasses Highbridge, Burdick, and Thompson streets. It features two pre-1840 brick houses—one an altered townhouse and the other the Goodfellow farmhouse at the south end of the village—and an intact Greek Revival wood frame house on South Burdick Street. Varied worker and middle class houses are interspersed with postwar development that erodes the overall historic integrity of this area. This feeling is further diminished by many empty lots at the north end of the neighborhood near Genesee Street.

Recommendation: This neighborhood is not recommended for listing as a district, but some individual properties may be eligible.

- **Ledyard Purchase:** The Ledyard Purchase comprises nearly all of the historic village south of Genesee Street between Limestone Creek and Manlius Street. This was platted and developed in association with three waterpower canals drawn off Limestone Creek and Bishop Brook between 1837 and 1849. Of these three, the rectilinear Ledyard Dyke or Canal opened in 1848 or 1849 remains a prominent feature of the neighborhood. Both the dyke and surrounding neighborhood retain a high degree of historic integrity spanning the period from its opening through the end of the historic period.

Recommendation: This neighborhood could be part of an expansion of the current Genesee Street Hill-Limestone Plaza NRHD, but it is strong enough to stand on its own. The Ledyard Canal or Dyke should be reviewed for documentation in the Historic American Engineering Record (HAER).

- **Salt Springs Road:** Historic residential development of various periods lines Salt Springs Road east of the upper commercial district. These overlie earlier farmland, and so early houses stand cheek by jowl with much later ones, although most predate 1948. The locally designated Greek Revival house at the corner of Salt Springs Road and South Manlius Street initiates this area. Individual properties in this neighborhood display variable historic integrity. Some may be individually eligible. The neighborhood, however, appears to retain a degree of integrity that might warrant its inclusion along with other neighborhoods in an expansion of the current historic district.

Recommendation: Further, more intensive review might establish a viable plan for either including this section in an expansion of the present Genesee Street Hill-Limestone Plaza NRHD or for listing salient properties.

- **Brooklea Heights and Collincroft:** Two early twentieth century residential subdivisions lie north of Elm Street between the highway formerly called North Mill Street, now Brooklea Drive, and Manlius Street. These opened before 1930 to offer new house lots to people. Some probably commuted to Syracuse. Houses in Brooklea

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

47

Heights are characteristic bungalows, four-squares, and modest “colonials” on traditional narrow frontage lots. These contrast with the irregular lotting of Collincroft, which exemplifies a less common pattern of using landforms in an organic fashion. In the latter, many houses appear to be individually designed. This subdivision filled in gradually, and there are early cottages and capes in the southern section on Linden Avenue and Mid-Century Modern examples farther north.

Recommendation: These two subdivisions form an intact neighborhood distinct from the adjacent one south of Elm and Mechanic streets. They might be independent historic district, but they may better be seen as illustrating how Fayetteville transformed from a commercial and industrial village of the nineteenth century and a commuter suburb of Syracuse in the twentieth century.

- **Huntleigh Park:** A third residential subdivision opened a short distance east of the right-of-way of the former “Chenango Branch” Railroad before 1930. It is east of the area shown on the Fayetteville plate in the 1874 atlas. Its location suggests that many residents were Syracuse commuters using the rail line. This subdivision appears to form a physically independent, potentially eligible historic district. It retains its original streetplan and an inventory of middle class houses. Houses here exemplify the “colonial” strain of architectural design popular during the 1920s and 1930s.

Recommendation: When opened, this subdivision was located on open land east of the village and felt visually separate from the village. It still feels like an enclave separate from the busy highways north and south of this neatly designed and highly intact neighborhood. The earlier section, marked by sidewalks and mainly between-the-wars houses, is eligible as historic district. The eastern section annexed in the 1950s was reviewed, but does not yet appear eligible for listing in the register. This may change with time.

- **Green spaces:** Within and adjacent to these sections, the village plan also incorporates green spaces. These include three cemeteries at the periphery of the historic village. All were established before 1900 and exemplify different types of historic-period funerary landscape architecture. There are also several parks. The earliest one, Washington Park, was set aside in the original block plan of the Ledyard Purchase. Two more parks incorporate a holding basin and a reservoir for the Ledyard Dyke, or Canal.

Recommendation: The Pioneer cemetery, or graveyard, on Genesee Street is a small park that might be included as part of a district. It does not appear individually eligible, but it adjoins properties on Salt Springs Road that might be part of an expansion district. Both the Fayetteville Cemetery (321 S Manlius St) and the Immaculate Conception Cemetery (558 E Genesee St) are eligible for listing. The former should be included in an expansion district; the latter might treated similarly to the Pioneer graveyard. If the diocese were agreeable, the Immaculate Conception holdings including its handsomely designed Mid-Century Modern church might be reviewed together for eligibility. The parks within the Ledyard Purchase are integral to the original plan and would be part

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

48

of a Ledyard Purchase historic district or expansion of the Genesee Street Hill-Limestone Plaza NRHD.

The Village of Fayetteville experienced rapid suburban residential subdivision after World War II. This survey reviewed the roughly 1,000 parcels within postwar subdivisions as components of neighborhoods to provide an illustrated baseline for future review. These annexations form lobes adjoining the historic village that are easily picked out on modern maps. Some strongly resemble their original appearance on a house-by-house basis; other have many alterations, although there are few losses. Additional research and evaluation may reveal that some of these neighborhoods are eligible for listing in the National Register. For others, the passage of time may alter a current determination of ineligibility.

Finally, Fayetteville has continued to open and expand parkland in this period most notably along the former Limestone Creek feeder and the Ledyard Canal. While no longer working sections of the village's economy, these places offer reminders of Fayetteville's past. The Canal Landing park retains the physical structure of the feeder itself. Present construction and landscaping differs greatly from its historic use and appearance. It is unclear whether it would be contributing in an expansion district.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

49

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Maps

- Burr, David H. *An Atlas of the State of New York containing a map of the State and of the Several Counties*. New York: David H. Burr, 1829.
- Fagan, L., "Map of Onondaga County, New York, from actual surveys under direction of Sidney & Neff, E.H. Babcock & Co., Syracuse, New York." Providence, Rhode Island: George C. Brown, 1852.
<https://www.loc.gov/resource/g3803o.la000526/?r=0.152,0.084,0.439,0.238,0>
- Fayetteville, Village of. Maps of annexations to the village dated 1935 through 1990. Not individually numbered; located in Drawer A in downstairs vault. These are frequently labeled with the assessor's name at the time, but sometimes also with the name of the subdivision being added.
- . Maps of Subdivisions annexed to the village dated 1929 through 1990. Not individually numbered; located in Drawers B and C in downstairs vault. These are frequently labeled with the assessor's name at the time, but sometimes also with the name of the subdivision being added.
- Hutchinson, Holmes. *Erie Canal Survey Maps*. Item numbers NYSA_A0848-77_MC7_DR11_V11_21_24; NYSA_A0848-77_MC7_DR6_V6_E6_30; NYSA_A0848-77_MC7_DR6_V6_E6_31. Manuscript. 1834. NYSA Digital collections under "Canal Survey Maps."
- McVicar, J.W. *A Map of the Ledyard purchase by the Fayetteville Hydraulic Company, July 30, 1849*. Manuscript. 1849. (Fayetteville, New York: Fayetteville Free Library (framed and displayed in cafe)) A second manuscript copy of this map is also presented at *Liber 92/pp. 2-3* in Onondaga County Clerk's Office associated with deed by which members of Fayetteville Hydraulic Company bought Jonathan D. Ledyard's interests.
- Sanborn Map & Publishing Co. "Fayetteville." New York: Sanborn Map & Publishing Co. 1885, 1890, 1896, 1904, 1919, 1929, 1943.
- Sweet, Homer D.L.. *Map of Onondaga County, New York*. Philadelphia: A.R.Z. Dawson, 1860.
<https://collections.lib.uwm.edu/digital/collection/agdm/id/1065/>
- Sweet, Homer D.L. *Sweet's New Atlas of Onondaga County, New York*. New York: Walker Bros., 1874.
- Tremain, Porter. *Map of the Village of Fayetteville, New York, with the Adjacent Lands and Water Powers*. n.p., 1849. (Fayetteville, New York: Fayetteville Free Library (framed and displayed in cafe))

Primary sources

- Child, Hamilton. *Gazetteer and Business Directory of Onondaga County, N.Y., for 1868-9*. Syracuse, New York: Journal Office, 1868.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

50

Disturnell, John. *A Gazetteer of the State of New-York: comprising its topography, geology, mineralogical resources, civil divisions, canals, railroads and public institutions; together with general statistics; the whole alphabetically arranged ; also, statistical tables, including the census of 1840; and tables of distances ; with a new township map of the state, etc.* Albany, New York: J. Disturnell, 1842.

Fayetteville, Village of, and Fayetteville Civic Club. *Fayetteville has Plans for your Future.* 1948. (Fayetteville, New York: Village Offices, archives)

French, J.H. *Gazetteer of the State of New York, embracing a comprehensive view of the Geography, Geology, and General History of the State.* [Syracuse: G.P. Smith], 1860.

Gordon, Thomas F. *Gazetteer of the state of New York: comprehending its colonial history; general geography, geology, and internal improvements; its political state; a minute description of tis several counties, towns, and villages ... with a map of the state, and a map of each county, and plans of the cities and principal villages.* Philadelphia: printed for author, 1836.

History, Rules and Regulations of Fayetteville Cemetery Association, Fayetteville, New York. Syracuse: Journal Book and Job Printers, 1865. (Fayetteville, New York: Fayetteville Free Library—Local History Room)

Land records filed in the Office of the Onondaga County Clerk. Deeds to and from Jonathan D. Ledyard and John G. Reilay, 1837–1849. Reviewed at FamilySearch.org.

New York, State of. *Census of Village of Fayetteville, Town of Manlius, Onondaga County for 1855.* Reviewed at FamilySearch.org.

———. *Census of Village of Fayetteville, Town of Manlius, Onondaga County for 1875.* Reviewed at FamilySearch.org.

———. *Census of Village of Fayetteville, Town of Manlius, Onondaga County for 1905.* Reviewed at FamilySearch.org.

———. *Census of Village of Fayetteville, Town of Manlius, Onondaga County for 1925.* Reviewed at FamilySearch.org.

Robinson, Charles Mulford. *Fayetteville Opportunities.* Rochester, New York, 1909.

Spafford, Horatio Gates. *Gazetteer of State of New York, etc.* Albany: H.C. Southwick, 1813.

———. *Gazetteer of State of New York, etc.* Albany: B.D. Packard, 1824.

Secondary sources

n.b. Except where noted otherwise, these sources do not supply source citation or source lists. They should be used with care as correlation with primary sources for this report has revealed errors of varying magnitude from inconsequential to glaring. There are additional resources located in the Local History Room of the Fayetteville Free Library (FFL, LHR) that are cited internally in the historical narrative when only referenced once or twice.

Historical Sketch of Fayetteville. Typescript (undated). [ca.1968-99]. (FFL, LHR)

Bruce, Dwight Hall. *Onondaga's Centennial: Gleanings of a Century.* Boston, Massachusetts: Boston History Company, 1896. Available at googlebooks.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

51

A subscription history of variable reliability. Like Clayton, it is more useful for events occurring in the previous 40 years or so. Earlier information is best corroborated, although this is not always possible.

Clayton, W.W. *History of Onondaga County, New York with Illustrations and Biographical Sketches*. Syracuse, New York: D. Mason & Co., 1878.

Subscription history. More useful for information that was recent in 1878; earlier information is best corroborated, although this is not always possible.

Fayetteville Free Library, Vertical files and street files in the Local History Room. (Fayetteville, New York: Fayetteville Free Library)

These files contain a wide variety of information, both published and unpublished. This includes photographs, newspaper clippings, historic-period pamphlets, uncited synopses discussing people, places, and events, in Fayetteville, etc.

Hesslein, Robert. "Fayetteville and the Paradox of Suburbia." Paper prepared for Study of the City course taught by J. Alexander Garvin (no institution noted). Typescript. 22 January 1974. (Fayetteville, New York: Village Offices, archives)

Well-researched and carefully observed paper with citations and a useful bibliography.

Houlihan, John T. *A History of the Ledyard Dyke (Fayetteville Hydraulic Canal)*. Typescript. 1977. (Village archives).

This paper draws mainly on Ledyard family papers. Information on Reilay's Dyke, in which Ledyard had no interest, is not borne out in deeds.

Newman, Charles S. "Memories of Fayetteville." Typescript. Prepared ca.1940 and available at http://www.everingham.com/family/data2/fayetteville_memo.html.

Provides a highly anecdotal and often personal description of various aspects of Fayetteville. Includes a street-by-street section with commentary on many individual houses and their owners. Uncited. Some sources, including Clayton and several mapping episodes, are self-evident. Others are more obscure and so difficult to locate.

Rivette, Barbara. *Fayetteville-Manlius School District. The First 50 Years*. Fayetteville-Manlius Schools, 2001.

———. *Glimpses of Fayetteville*. [Fayetteville, New York: Village of Fayetteville, 1994].

———. Leaflets (trifolds) prepared by Manlius Town Historian Barbara Rivette. These include *The Fayetteville Feeder: The Heart of the Village's Prosperity* (2013), *The Fayetteville Cemetery Association*, and walking tour leaflets of the village. Few sources mentioned; no citations.

———. Synopses prepared by Manlius Town Historian Barbara Rivette in her capacity as village historian.

These range from a single page to several pages on a variety of topics including "210 Walnut Street and 311 Warren Street," "336 Highbridge St," "Brookside, Maplewood, Carriage Hill and more," "Fayetteville Parks and Open Spaces," "McIntyre Paper Mill—131 Mill Street," "North Branch of the Seneca Turnpike/Route 5/Genesee Street," "Precision Casting/Syracuse Plastics Site—Clinton, Walnut, Ledyard Dyke and Chapel Streets," "Route 257/Fayetteville-Manlius Road," "Salt Springs Road," "Wellwood School a/k/a Fayetteville High School." Dates of preparation provided on most synopses. Few sources mentioned; no citations.

Reconnaissance level Historic Resources Survey

Fayetteville, Onondaga County, New York
30 September 2018

52

Souvenir Book of Fayetteville. Celebrating Completion of a New Street. September 5th, 1921. Published by the Dennis Post of the American Legion. 1921. (Fayetteville, New York: Village Offices archives)

Offers pictures and anecdotal history of the village based, according to Town Historian Barbara Rivette, on the recollections of Lucy Seward Noble. Most interesting for its pictures and numerous advertisements for local businesses.

Williams, Craig S. *A History of the Erie Canal near Fayetteville, New York.* Typescript, n.d. (provided by Craig Polhamus, Village Historical Commission)

Well-documented, drawing mainly on Canal Commission papers of the period.

Wright, Jay B. *Historic Fayetteville Buildings and Sites. A compilation of information about historic sties within the Village of Fayetteville, New York, taken primarily from previously published materials.* Manuscript. (Provided by Craig Polhamus, Village Historical Commission)